

Summary on Globalization

*Main Outcomes of the Work of the Pontifical
Academy of Social Sciences on Globalization*

Edited by **Juan José Llach**



THE PONTIFICAL ACADEMY
OF SOCIAL SCIENCES • 2008

THE PONTIFICAL ACADEMY OF SOCIAL SCIENCES

EXTRA SERIES 12

SUMMARY ON GLOBALIZATION

**MAIN OUTCOMES OF THE WORK OF THE PONTIFICAL
ACADEMY OF SOCIAL SCIENCES ON GLOBALIZATION**

SUMMARY ON GLOBALIZATION

MAIN OUTCOMES OF THE WORK OF THE PONTIFICAL
ACADEMY OF SOCIAL SCIENCES ON GLOBALIZATION



THE PONTIFICAL ACADEMY
OF SOCIAL SCIENCES

ISBN 978-88-86726-22-1

© Copyright 2008

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form, or by any means, electronic, mechanical, recording, photocopying or otherwise without the expressed written permission of the publisher.

THE PONTIFICAL ACADEMY OF SOCIAL SCIENCES
VATICAN CITY

Contents

<i>Foreword</i> (Louis Sabourin)	13
<i>Introduction</i>	15
1. Globalization, Charity and Justice on the Eve of 21st Century: New Signs of the New Times	19
1.1. <i>Historical framework: globalization, its governance and the Social Doctrine of the Church since the Second World War</i>	19
1.1.1. <i>Normalization at the end of the war</i>	19
1.2. <i>New signs of the times</i>	22
1.2.1. <i>World politics and governance</i>	22
1.2.1.1. <i>Terrorism, new forms of violence, war and nuclear threats</i>	22
1.2.1.2. <i>Multilateralism and weakening of world governance</i>	23
1.2.1.3. <i>Vitality of regionalism</i>	23
1.2.1.4. <i>Re-emergence of nationalism, growing intra-national autonomic demands and new challenges to national states</i>	24
1.2.1.5. <i>Growing demands and realities of political participation, even technologically driven</i>	25
1.2.1.6. <i>Silent building of a new consensus on the roles of the state, markets and the civil society</i>	25

1.2.2. <i>Economic growth, trade and finances</i>	26
1.2.2.1. <i>The possibility of a long and widespread wave of economic growth</i>	26
1.2.2.2. <i>International finances: world imbalances and weaknesses and increased autonomy of emerging countries</i>	27
1.2.2.3. <i>Governance delays but real progress in international trade</i>	29
1.2.2.4. <i>The role of Foreign Direct Investment</i>	29
1.2.2.5. <i>Unresolved questions regarding patents</i>	30
1.2.3. <i>Poverty and the social and economic gaps</i>	31
1.2.3.1. <i>Pervasive poverty</i>	31
1.2.3.2. <i>Millennium Goals</i>	31
1.2.3.3. <i>Insufficient and inefficient aid</i>	32
1.2.3.4. <i>Mixed signals regarding convergence and the gaps</i>	33
1.2.3.5. <i>Very uneven income distribution</i>	33
1.2.4. <i>The environment</i>	34
1.2.4.1. <i>New evidence and increased awareness of environmental deterioration</i>	34
1.2.5. <i>Challenges to local communities and cultural identities</i>	35
1.2.5.1. <i>Challenges from increased migrations and international trade and finances</i>	35
1.2.6. <i>Civilization clash or civilization change?</i>	35

2. Main Outcomes of the Previous Work of the Academy on Globalization	37
2.1. <i>Introduction: drivers, traits and ethical consequences. The challenges of globalization and their relationship with the Social Doctrine of the Church</i>	37
2.1.1. <i>Critical challenges in a world that is really global for the first time in human history</i>	37
2.1.2. <i>What kind of globalization?</i>	38
2.1.3. <i>Excessive predominance of economic forces.....</i>	38
2.1.4. <i>Marginalization of the needy</i>	38
2.1.5. <i>Globalization's actors and democracy</i>	38
2.1.6. <i>Threats to cultural identities and new roles for religions</i>	39
2.1.7. <i>Regionalization.....</i>	39
2.1.8. <i>International migrations</i>	39
2.1.9. <i>Globalization and corruption.....</i>	39
2.1.10. <i>Globalization and the environment.....</i>	40
2.2. <i>The Social Doctrine of the Church.....</i>	40
2.2.1. <i>The contribution of the Social Doctrine of the Church</i>	40
2.2.2. <i>The two faces of globalization.....</i>	40
2.2.3. <i>Globalization, the human person and the priority of ethics.....</i>	40
2.2.4. <i>Humanity called to be a single, ethically founded family.....</i>	41

2.2.5. <i>The preferential option for the poor</i>	41
2.2.6. <i>Universal common good and the governance of globalization</i>	41
2.2.7. <i>Respect for cultural diversity and intermediary groups</i>	42
2.2.8. <i>Worldwide nature of the social question, globalization in solidarity, integral human development and the role of freedom</i>	42
2.2.9. <i>Risks of absolutizing the economy and the roles of the market and of the private sector</i>	42
2.2.10. <i>Developing and developed countries and the crucial role of international trade</i>	43
2.2.11. <i>Indebtedness of developing countries</i>	43
2.3. <i>Recent developments of the Social Doctrine of the Church: the Encyclical Deus Caritas Est and other teachings of Pope Benedict XVI</i>	44
2.3.1. <i>Deus Caritas Est</i>	44
2.3.2. <i>Other teachings of Pope Benedict XVI</i>	47
2.4. <i>Globalization, poverty and the gaps</i>	49
2.4.1. <i>Lights and shadows regarding globalization and old and new poverties</i>	49
2.4.2. <i>Globalization and the gaps</i>	50
2.4.3. <i>Hypotheses about the gaps</i>	50
2.4.4. <i>Poverty, equity and the Millennium Goals</i>	51

2.5. <i>Globalization, cultural identities, the role of religions and of inter-religious dialogue</i>	52
2.5.1. <i>Globalization and cultural identities</i>	52
2.5.2. <i>Respect for cultural diversity and the role of education</i>	53
2.5.3. <i>Religious identities</i>	54
2.5.4. <i>The role of religions and of inter-religious dialogue</i>	54
2.6. <i>Globalization and migrations</i>	55
2.6.1. <i>Migrations intensity</i>	55
2.6.2. <i>Migrations and education</i>	55
2.6.3. <i>Migrations and citizenships</i>	56
2.7. <i>Globalization and education</i>	57
2.7.1. <i>Globalization, cultural interdependence and the values of the spirit</i>	57
2.7.2. <i>The aims of education</i>	57
2.7.3. <i>Globalization, education and peace</i>	58
2.7.4. <i>Education, relativism and nihilism</i>	59
2.7.5. <i>Globalization, education and justice</i>	59
2.7.6. <i>Education and the family</i>	61
2.7.7. <i>Education and teachers</i>	61
2.7.8. <i>Education, communication and information technologies (IT)</i>	62
2.8. <i>The civil society and the role of charities</i>	62

2.8.1. <i>Globalization, culture and the role of communities</i>	62
2.8.2. <i>The role of charities</i>	63
2.8.3. <i>Approaches to the fight against poverty</i>	63
2.8.4. <i>The third sector and authentic social movements in developing countries</i>	64
2.9. <i>The governance of globalization</i>	64
2.9.1. <i>Preliminaries for the governance of globalization</i>	64
2.9.1.1. <i>Weak governance</i>	64
2.9.1.2. <i>The universal common good</i>	65
2.9.1.3. <i>A chaos risk</i>	65
2.9.1.4. <i>The question of a world government</i>	66
2.9.2. <i>Towards a democratic international order</i>	67
2.9.2.1. <i>The nexus between the rule of international law and democracy</i>	67
2.9.2.2. <i>Crisis of the national states?</i>	68
2.9.2.3. <i>An international citizenship and civil society?</i>	68
2.9.2.4. <i>Which values at the world level?</i>	69
2.9.2.5. <i>International organizations and human rights</i>	69
2.9.2.6. <i>Governance of international institutions</i>	70
2.9.2.7. <i>Universal versus idiosyncratic institutions and the institutional weaknesses of LDCs</i>	70
2.9.2.8. <i>Regional integration processes</i>	71

2.9.3. <i>Governance of globalization: the economy</i>	72
2.9.3.1. <i>Governance of international trade</i>	72
2.9.3.2. <i>Governance of international finances</i>	73
2.9.3.3. <i>Insufficient aid to developing countries</i>	75
2.10. <i>The environment</i>	76
2.10.1. <i>The anthropocene and a worldwide strategy</i>	76
2.10.2. <i>Exhausting of fuels, pollution and global warming</i>	76
2.10.3. <i>Water</i>	77
2.10.4. <i>Global warming, water and agriculture in poor regions</i>	78
2.11. <i>Proposals made by the participants</i>	78
2.11.1. <i>General approaches</i>	78
2.11.2. <i>Poverty reduction and alleviation</i>	79
2.11.3. <i>Reducing the gaps</i>	80
2.11.4. <i>Education</i>	80
2.11.5. <i>Migrations</i>	81
2.11.6. <i>Aid and a new world social contract</i>	81
2.11.7. <i>Empowerment</i>	82
2.11.8. <i>The role of religions and civil society</i>	82
2.11.9. <i>Global warming</i>	83
2.11.10. <i>International trade</i>	83

2.11.11. <i>International finances</i>	84
2.12. <i>References</i>	87
Appendix I	
<i>Guidelines for the future of globalization</i>	89
Appendix II	
<i>Programs of the Sessions and Workshops of the Pontifical Academy of Social Sciences on Different Dimensions of Globalization</i>	94

Foreword

When the Council of the Pontifical Academy of Social Sciences decided in 1999 to include the study of 'globalization' in its work program, no one could foresee that such an initiative would eventually bring about so many members as well as observers, experts, researchers and practitioners from so many disciplines and so many areas of the world. Pope John Paul II stated so rightly in his address to the Ninth Plenary Session of the Academy, on May 2nd, 2003: '*Globalization needs to be inserted into the larger context of a political and economical program that seeks the authentic progress of all human mankind. In this way, it will serve the whole human family no longer longing benefit merely to a privileged few but advancing the common good of all*'.

Indeed, we realized that the subject in itself was so complex that it would require several meetings, held in Rome and elsewhere, notably in Mexico and Colombia, as well as discussions with various institutions including the Pontifical Academy of Sciences. These meetings resulted in the publication of the following books: *The Social Dimensions of Globalization* (2000); *Globalization, Ethical and Institutional Concerns* (2001); *Globalization and Inequalities* (2002); *The Governance of Globalization* (2004); *Globalization and Education* (2005); *Globalización y Justicia Internacional* (2006); and *Charity and Justice in the Relations among People and Nations* (2007).

One of the main conclusions was that globalization had not solely economic, technical, financial, political and juridical aspects but also social, cultural, philosophical, ethical and religious dimensions which required new types of cooperation. As

Pope Benedict XVI stated in his homily of November 17th, 2007, '*solidarity is the greatest challenge of mankind in the age of globalization*'.

Our President, Professor Mary Ann Glendon, and the Council considered that a summary of these works, which began under the Presidency of Professor Edmond Malinvaud, would be needed not only for the members of the Academy and for the Holy See, but also for readers worldwide. Such a task required not only a lot of time and special skills, but also someone who had participated to the discussions, so that he could represent the main views expressed by the members and the conclusions that were reached at each meeting. We were very privileged that a member of the Committee on globalization, Professor Juan José Llach, from Argentina, accepted very generously to undertake such a challenge. I would like to thank and congratulate him for having succeeded in presenting, in such a concise and clear manner, the outcomes of the work on *globalization* of the Pontifical Academy of Social Sciences.

I take this opportunity to express my gratitude to all those who participated in this project. Finally, I address my profound thanks to the Chancellor, Msgr. Marcelo Sánchez Sorondo, and to the staff of the Secretariat for their constant and efficient collaboration.

Professor LOUIS SABOURIN

Introduction

The truth, I have now come to realize, is that God does not have favorites, but that anyone, of any nationality, who fears God and does what is right, is acceptable to him (*Acts*, 10:34).

It is the universal common good which demands that control mechanisms should accompany the inherent logic of the market. Globalization, *a priori*, is neither good nor bad. It will be what people make of it. No system is an end in itself, and it is necessary to insist that globalization, like any other system, must be at the service of the human person; it must serve solidarity and the common good (HH JPII to *PASS*, 2001).

Our times call for a new readiness to assist our neighbors in need...Concern for our neighbor transcends the confines of national communities and has increasingly broadened its horizon to the whole world (HH Benedict XVI, *Deus Caritas Est*).

In the recent past, the Pontifical Academy of Social Sciences has devoted various meetings to analyze and to discuss different aspects of the phase of globalization we are going through¹. All

¹ The list of the meetings specifically addressed to globalization is as follows. a) *The Social Dimensions of Globalization* (2000, workshop). b) *Globalization: Ethical and Institutional Concerns* (2001, plenary session). c) *Globalization and Inequal-*

this work has enabled us to reaffirm that, without ignoring many positive developments carried on by globalization², there is a lack of charity and justice in the world we live in. This may be summarized in general as disproportionate allocations or reallocations of any kind of resources, promises not honored and unequal divisions. At the same time, worldwide, regional or national institutional arrangements and policies have not developed enough so as to give successful answers to these complex challenges. Within the framework of the centennial teachings of the Social Doctrine of the Church, those challenges have been addressed by the renewed appeals to charity and justice made by the Pope, Benedict XVI, in particular in his encyclical *Deus Caritas Est*.

ities (2002, colloquium). d) *The Governance of Globalization* (2003, plenary session). e) *Charity and Justice in the Relations Among Peoples and Nations* (2007, plenary session). The programs of those meetings can be found in Appendix II. Some other issues related to globalization have been dealt in the following plenary sessions. (f) *On Democracy* (1998). (g) On different aspects of *Intergenerational Solidarity* (2002, 2003 and 2006). (h) The seminar of the Joint Working Group of the Pontifical Academies of Sciences and Social Sciences on *Globalization and Education* (2005). Other relevant and pertinent works of the Academy are the following. i) Edmond Malinvaud and Margaret S. Archer (2003, editors), *Work and Human Fulfilment*, Michigan: Sapientia Press, a synthesis of the work of the Academy on work, employment and unemployment (1996, 1997, 1998 and 1999 plenary sessions). j) The forum on the priority of labor that took place on May, 5, 2003 (published in 2004). k) The synthesis of the work of the Academy on democracy (a workshop in 1996 and the plenary sessions of 1998 and 2000), prepared and edited by Hans F. Zacher (2005), *Democracy in Debate. The Contribution of the Pontifical Academy of Social Sciences*. See the website of the Pontifical Academy of Social Sciences: http://www.vatican.va/roman_curia/pontifical_academies/acdscien/index_social_en.htm.

² All along the document the word *globalization* appears as the subject of many sentences. As we all know, globalization is a very complex worldwide process of profound changes in quality and increases in almost all kinds of

As a contribution to a better understanding of these new realities, the Pontifical Academy of Social Sciences offers this document, organized as follows. The first part is focused on identifying the new signs of the times that we should cautiously read to assess if they enhance or threaten an improved effectiveness of charity and justice in the relations among peoples and nations at the beginning of this new millennium. To better understand the current stage of globalization this section begins with an introductory historical framework that summarizes the main developments of globalization, its governance and the role of the Social Doctrine of the Church since the Second World War. The second part presents a very brief synthesis of the previous work of the Academy on globalization³, including recent contributions to the development of the Social Doctrine of the Church made by HH Pope Benedict XVI. This section is complemented by an appendix containing guidelines for a better future of this stage of globalization. All along the document we

human relations across the borders of national states. This process includes economic aspects like trade and finances; the revolution in communications, both through the internet and the widespread use of cell phones; increased migrations; new kinds of social relationships; cultural conflicts between the values of global capitalism and those of local, religious or other traditional cultures; the growing development of international, public, private and third sector agencies and the development of supra-national states or regional associations. Confronted with such a complex process, the use of 'globalization' as a subject could sometimes be confusing or misleading. However, we have preferred to follow this linguistic procedure in order to have clearer sentences, hoping that their context will allow the reader to understand to which specific aspects of globalization we are referring to each time we use the word. We also hope that the analyses of many aspects of the process presented in the text will help convey our intended meaning.

³ Those interested in a broader synthesis can see the document entitled *The Pontifical Academy of Social Sciences on Globalization* sent to PASS Academicians during the XIII Plenary Session (2007).

look at the relations between different peoples and nations, the developed and the developing, the emerging and the poor, from the point of view of the virtues of charity and justice. We ask ourselves whether these relations, in the light of the Social Doctrine of the Church, can become more just, fairer, and more peaceful, and what the route should be to achieve such ends.

1. GLOBALIZATION, CHARITY AND JUSTICE ON THE EVE OF THE 21ST CENTURY: NEW SIGNS OF THE NEW TIMES

1.1. *Historical framework: globalization, its governance and the Social Doctrine of the Church since the Second World War*

1.1.1. *Normalization at the end of the war*

After the great destruction and hardships caused by the war, positive signs followed from clear attempts to promote peace and development again at the world level.

A. *A renovated international organization*

The *Organization of the United Nations* was instituted in San Francisco in June 1945 by the coalition of victorious states, on the basis of principles borrowed from the interwar League of Nations: an open structure of pacific democratic and independent states; a provisional international tutelage regime was maintained for territories which, after the first world war, had been placed under the mandate of the League of Nations.

The Church's Magisterium did not fail to note the positive value of the new world organization. It particularly praised the *Universal Declaration of Human Rights*, adopted by the United Nations on 10 December 1948, which Pope John Paul II defined as 'a true milestone on the path of humanity's moral progress' (quoted in paragraph 152 of the *Compendium of the Social Doctrine of the Church*).

Unfortunately, notwithstanding the text of the United Nations Charter, and even after the German and Japanese resig-

nations, peace did not last long. Already in the early 1950s tensions increased among the few members of the UN Security Council. Indeed tensions quickly mounted, firstly because of the Korean war, and later because of decolonization and 'the cold war'. Important 'new things' then followed from decolonization and from the emergence of a three-polar world.

B. Decolonization

Colonial history goes back to the sixteenth century. But decolonization spread over the following centuries, often violently. The following is a rough account of this process. It shows how in the immediate postwar period that reversal experienced a large boost, mostly with the approval of the Church.

In Latin America, most Spanish and Portuguese colonies became independent in the first decade of the nineteenth century. In Asia, after more than three centuries of Spanish domination, the Philippines were ruled by the USA from 1897 and became independent in 1946. India followed in 1947, with Pakistan soon experiencing a partition, first from India and secondly from West Bengal. Indonesia became independent in 1945-49. Most French and British colonies became independent in the 1955-66 period, with Portuguese African colonies being kept longer. South Africa obtained independence in 1961, but became a multiracial democracy only in 1990.

It makes sense to read the subtitle of the introduction to the *Compendium* of the Social Doctrine as being *An Integral and Solidary Humanism*, of which decolonization is an important part, as implicit in the sentence: 'the Church continues to speak of all people and nations' (page 1). Some important writings of the Magisterium were explicit early on. The encyclical *Pacem in Terris* of Pope John XXIII (1963) was not only meant to address an era marked by nuclear proliferation. It also called 'all men of

good will' to 'the great task to establish with truth, justice, love and freedom new methods of relationship in human society' so as to 'tackle and solve problems of an economic, social, political or cultural character which are posed by the universal common good' (*Compendium*, page 55). In the Pastoral Constitution *Gaudium et Spes* (1966) the Second Vatican Council addressed the problems of development cooperation starting from the vocation of the whole human race to unity (*Compendium*, page 9). In the encyclical *Populorum Progressio* (1967) Pope Paul VI claimed that 'development is the new name for peace' (*Compendium*, page 57). These various documents prepared the encyclical *Sollicitudo Rei Socialis* (1987) of Pope John Paul II, which stipulated in particular: 'collaboration in the whole development of every human being is in fact a duty of *all towards all*, and must be shared by the four parts of the world: East and West, North and South' (*Compendium*, page 251).

C. *Emergence of a three-polar world*

Turning back to the tensions of the 1950s and 1960s between the Eastern and Western Blocs, remembering the simultaneous resurgence of globalization in the West with fast increasing international trade and migrations, noting also the two forms of governance with the West praising markets and the East applying state controls, we must point to the role and singularities of the so-called Third World, then meant to cover 'less-developed countries'. An important split between public opinions then became manifest, the Third World being subjected to ideological influences, which were coming from both sides or emerging from within its own intelligentsia.

This split carried on through the recent history of globalization. But the last two decades of the twentieth century also turned out to be announcing new signs that are explained in the

next sections: a number of countries of the ‘Eastern bloc’ returned to democracy; fast economic growth in a number of countries of the ‘Third World’ meant harsh competition with the ‘Western bloc’, and some other discontents mounted in the ‘Western bloc’ about features of economic growth (forms of competition in the labor market, impact of consumerism) and frequent neglect of the environment.

The Social Doctrine of the Church quickly reacted with due reservations to such new conditions, as is particularly apparent in the Pastoral Constitution *Gaudium et Spes* and in the Encyclicals *Sollicitudo Rei Socialis* and *Centesimus Annus*.

1.2. *New signs of the times*⁴

The eve of this century has been astonishingly plentiful of new signs of the times, both positive and negative, as regards the common pursuit of the effectiveness of charity and justice among peoples and nations.

1.2.1. *World politics and governance*

1.2.1.1. *Terrorism, new forms of violence, war and nuclear threats*

As the tragedy of 11 September 2001 and its aftermath have shown, the beginning of the new millennium has been

⁴ This part of the paper benefited greatly from very valuable books and papers published after the last plenary session on globalization in 2003. They include those of Bhagwati (2004), Castells (2003), Davies *et al.* (2006), Friedman (2006), Fukuyama (2004), Her Majesty’s Treasury (Stern Report, 2006), Huntington (2005), Niskanen and Thorbecke (2007), The Pontifical Academy of Sciences (Water and the Environment, 2005), Rodrik (2003 and 2006), Sachs (2005), Sala i Martin (2006), Stiglitz (2006), UNEP-WMO (Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change, 2007), UNESCO (2005), United Nations (2006), United Nations Environment Program (2007) and Wolf (2004).

characterized by serious threats to world peace, a noteworthy rise in the social and moral scourge of terrorism, new and old wars between and within countries, increased weapons production and trade, and the revival of nuclear proliferation and threats⁵. For the first time since the end of the Cold War the possibility of a nuclear conflict seems open again. Additionally, international organized crime, particularly drugs trafficking and money laundering, keeps growing.

1.2.1.2. *Multilateralism and the weakening of world governance*

Whereas unilateral, bilateral and regional actions and organizations proliferate in the international arena, multilateralism seems to be weakening dangerously. This can be seen in a broad variety of issues, from the difficulties in reaching a consensus on a common strategy against international terrorism to the serious problems of finding ways to fix world financial and trade imbalances and misalignments of exchange rates. In parallel, there is a deterioration of multilateral institutions, such as the UN, the WTO, the IMF or the World Bank and their regional counterparts, whose roles are either blurred or increasingly difficult to perform. As it will be developed in section 2.9, the need for sound, solid world governance is one of the main conclusions of the previous work of the Academy, but the crisis of multilateralism is a serious obstacle to it.

1.2.1.3. *Vitality of regionalism*

The other side of the coin of the weakening of multilateralism is a vital, noteworthy development of regionalism, i.e.,

⁵ One of the few positive signals on these matters has been the beginning of a complex process of dismantling North Korea's nuclear program and facilities.

unions of countries, generally of the same continent. According to the WTO there are now 32 major regional agreements and around 300 'minor' ones⁶.

1.2.1.4. *Re-emergence of nationalism, growing intra-national autonomic demands and new challenges to national states*

Developments regarding national states are contrasting. There seems to be, on the one hand, a re-emergence of nationalism, shown in negative reactions against the free movement of goods, capitals and people, even inside regional associations. Particularly sensitive are the reactions against immigrants in different parts of the world – including, for the first time since the fall of the Berlin Wall, the building of other big walls to separate countries in America, Asia and the Middle East⁷. Sometimes, re-emergent nationalism goes hand in hand with fundamentalism, religious or not. On the other hand, national states, the cradle and still the only major place of democratic life, are suffering unprecedented challenges to their sovereignty coming from the already mentioned regionalisms and from incredibly widespread local autonomic demands under the different headings of devolution, decentralization, federalization, or even partition. There are not many countries where the legal or real powers of the central government were not questioned by regions, states or

⁶ There are 5 regional agreements in Africa, Asia, Latin America and the Caribbean; 4 in Oceania; 3 in Europe and the Former Soviet Union; 3 intercontinental ones, mostly between LDCs; 1 in Eastern Europe, the Middle East, North America and former insular colonies.

⁷ Such is the case of the walls separating Brazil from Paraguay, USA from Mexico, Israel from Palestinian territories and India from Bangladesh.

⁸ Just to mention a few examples, we can enumerate the cases of Bolivia (East versus West); Ecuador and Mexico (Chiapas) in Latin America; the ever latent situation of Quebec in Canada; the devolution process in the United

provinces, only in some cases associated with ethnic conflicts⁸. Perhaps it is too early to speak of a crisis of national states, but the present situation evokes more and more the one that prevailed when they were born, on the eve of the modern era.

1.2.1.5. Growing demands and realities of political participation, even technologically driven

The aforementioned crises and tensions affecting polities at the world, regional, national and sub-national levels also appear to be associated with increased and widespread demands of political participation, to which the bottom-up nature of internet is contributing⁹. It seems clear that these demands have the potential to improve democracy.

1.2.1.6. Silent building of a new consensus on the roles of the state, markets and the civil society

In spite of all the criticism towards world order, or disorder, and perhaps more in line with the so-called crisis of the ideologies, there are some budding signals of the end of the age of extreme alternatives on the socio-economic front, like market vs.

Kingdom; the increasing power of the autonomies in Spain and Italy, and threats of partition in Belgium; the never-ending partition of former Yugoslavia; the autonomic demands of the Kurds in Iran, Iraq and Turkey, as well as the three-party separatist tensions in Iraq; the conflicts inside the Caucasian republics, and even inside the Russian Federation; the co-existence of different local powers in Afghanistan; the cases of Myanmar, Nepal and Sri Lanka; diverse decentralization or federalist demands in China, India, Indonesia, Papua, The Philippines and Thailand; the tragic situations of Somalia and Sudan, the Central African Republic and Chad, as well as other innumerable ethnic conflicts in Africa.

⁹ As Manuel Castells (2003) and Tom Friedman (2006) have analyzed.

planning and, on the political front, individualism vs. totalitarianism. A three-dimensional social order seems to emerge instead, based on a renewed role of autonomous organizations of the civil society, together with the markets and the state¹⁰.

1.2.2. *Economic growth, trade and finances*

1.2.2.1. *The possibility of a long and widespread wave of economic growth*

The beginning of the 21st century has been accompanied by an acceleration of economic growth almost all over the world, only comparable to what happened during the ‘golden age’ of the late fifties, the sixties and the early seventies of the last century¹¹. There are good chances that this acceleration will last, becoming a long wave of economic growth and, perhaps for the first time in human history, some of its main drivers are coming from emerging and even poor countries. First, the acceleration of economic growth in Asia, which implies the incorporation of almost half of the world population in modern patterns of consumption and a huge supply of low wage-labor, also leads to a strong increase in the demand and price of commodities, most of them produced in LDCs¹². Secondly, emerging and even poor countries have an enormous potential to catch-up, incorporating the newest information and communication technologies in

¹⁰ As analyzed by Fukuyama (2004 and previous works) and Huntington (2005 and 2006).

¹¹ World GDP per capita growth rate was 2.9% in the 1950-73 period, and it has been exactly the same since 1998 to 2007 (projected). It is also impressive that only 3 out of 181 countries have had negative GDP pc growth rates in the last period. They are Haiti, Seychelles and Zimbabwe.

¹² All along this document the acronym LDC designs all developing countries while DC refers to developed countries.

production and consumption resulting in rapid increases in productivity¹³. Thirdly, a new consensus on economic policies is emerging and being applied in many LDCs, centered on obtaining twin fiscal and external surpluses and accumulating foreign reserves¹⁴. Fourthly, many LDCs are consistently increasing their concern over education and their investment in it. However, this developing countries-driven long wave of economic growth confronts serious threats coming from financial world imbalances, trade restrictions, environmental deterioration and social gaps and poverty, all of them mentioned below.

1.2.2.2. International finances: world imbalances and weaknesses and increased autonomy of emerging countries

International finances have also reached the new millennium with contrasting news. On the one hand, the already mentioned twin surpluses of many emerging countries imply that they are financially more autonomous than in the past, even up to the point of becoming relevant bankers of the planet, creating problems of idle capacity for their traditional lenders like the IMF, the World Bank and the regional banks¹⁵. The flip side of the coin is the continuous increase in the balance of payments deficits of some developed countries¹⁶. Taken together, these

¹³ Cf. Friedman (2006).

¹⁴ One of the tools to obtain these surpluses is keeping the local currencies as depreciated as possible in order to foster competitiveness. This policy, however, can lead to higher inflation.

¹⁵ In the case of the IMF, emerging big debtors like Argentina, Brazil, Indonesia and Turkey have totally or partially repaid their debts.

¹⁶ The most relevant is the balance of payments deficit of the USA, which amounted in 2007 to around \$750 billion or 5.5% of GDP.

imbalances reveal a misalignment of some of the most relevant exchange rates¹⁷ and are, at the same time, a potential problem for the stability of the world financial order and a threat to the continuity of the current world economic growth. This risk is leveraged because of new financial developments that rapidly increase world liquidity and offer new opportunities for development financing but, at the same time, threaten world financial stability. International coordination of monetary and financial supervisory authorities is more necessary than ever to gain in coordination and codes of conduct. Already many people think that some financial developments like the explosive growth of private equity and derivatives markets could be excessive when compared to the 'real' economy¹⁸. While the Bretton Woods system had a clear mandate to create a fair system of aid to developing nations, the governance structure of the current system, almost exclusively in the hands of private agents and speculative investments, carries a risks of contagion and is frequently unfair. Because of a perverse interaction between the inherent volatility of financial markets and the paramount importance of reputation in them, capital flows are very frequently going against theoretical predictions, i.e., from developing to developed countries. It also seems convenient to re-think the global system of monetary reserves that could be neither the optimal one nor the most equitable. A cautious reform of this system might eventually generate resources to finance the development of the least developed countries.

¹⁷ Particularly relevant is the undervaluation of the main Asian currencies against the US dollar.

¹⁸ After writing this paper, these excesses became evident with the crisis of sub-prime mortgages and their derivatives.

1.2.2.3. *Governance delays but real progress in international trade*

International trade is another field in which we can see lights and shadows. On the governance front, the delays, even the threat of a paralysis in the Doha round of the World Trade Organization, are not a good piece of news, less so since they are mainly explained by resistances of DCs to gradually but firmly reducing agricultural protectionism and subsidies, which are very damaging for many LDCs. But at the same time we are witnessing an impressive growth in the world trade of goods and services¹⁹. Furthermore, it is a growth with a pro-poor bias because of the induced increase in commodities' prices. For the time being, the traditional deterioration of the terms of trade against poor countries has reversed, and more so if we consider the increased purchasing power of commodities in terms of biotechnological products and information, and communications technology hardware and software, whose prices go down every year²⁰.

1.2.2.4. *The role of Foreign Direct Investment*

Foreign Direct Investment (FDI) appears as one of the most concrete ways to efficiently solve the insufficiency of savings or investments in least developed countries²¹, particularly because

¹⁹ World physical trade annual growth in the period 2000-2005 (5.6%) has not yet reached the level of the 1950-1971 period (8.2%). However, growth rates in dollar terms are higher now (14.5% vs. 8.6%).

²⁰ Criticism from DCs to the exchange rate undervaluation in Asian countries is not irrelevant, because it can eventually aggravate financial imbalances and lead to protectionist measures in countries with high trade deficits.

²¹ This is not the case of emerging countries in this century, since most of them are running foreign current account surpluses.

of its association with an improvement in human capital. However, these types of investment account for only a small percentage of total investment in LDCs. Economic logic alone is not sufficient to deal with the complex problems we are facing nowadays on a planetary scale. That is why FDI is and should be in the future increasingly subjected to the social responsibility of the firms as regards human rights and labor conditions; sustainable development; the rights of stakeholders and their integration into societies; the rights of consumers; legal frameworks, governance and anti-corruption policies; due respect for the environment; avoiding an excessive prevalence of financial criteria and, finally, making sure that local realities are taken on board when fixing global policies, according to the principle of subsidiarity.

1.2.2.5. *Unresolved questions regarding patents*

Even when logical from the point of view of promoting scientific and technological research, it is becoming more and more evident that the legal monopoly of knowledge given by patents creates conditions of difficult access of LDCs to basic knowledge, even in critical health issues. These conditions are not only more rigid than they were for DCs at the beginning of their industrialization. They are also more serious because governments, firms or universities of DCs are now in a better position to pay higher salaries to the most qualified scientists, technicians and professionals from LDCs. This is like a donation of LDCs to DCs, and an appreciable loss to LDCs in the process of creating competitive advantages based on human capital²².

²² See Stiglitz (2006, Ch. 4) and Boldrin and Levine (2006). Some authors have emphasized positive aspects of these migrations, like the development of networks between emigrants and their native countries, enabling the newest technologies to be spread there.

1.2.3. *Poverty and the social and economic gaps*

1.2.3.1. *Pervasive poverty*

In spite of accelerated economic growth poverty is still very pervasive in most countries. It is far from clear, however, whether globalization is to blame for it, or whether it is a natural, undesirable consequence of the initial stages of economic growth per se as it happened, for instance, at the beginning of the industrial revolution. A very sad manifestation of urban poverty is the growing socio-geographic segregation of the rich from the poor through the building of walls and closed neighborhoods in many cities. Notwithstanding its pervasiveness, both the incidence and the amount of people living in *extreme income poverty* have been reduced in the last quarter of a century, co-existing with the intensification of globalization. This reduction, however, is mainly explained by the rapid growth of Asia, in such sharp contrast with that of Africa that this last continent is nowadays home to 75% of the income poor of the world²³. Some Latin American countries have also had increases in both dimensions of poverty at the beginning of this century.

1.2.3.2. *Millennium Goals*

The eve of the century also witnessed the launch of these goals. They are incomplete – completely ignoring, for instance, the family and its role in the integral development of human beings. At the same time they look feasible, promising and based

²³ Sala i Martin (2006). Of course, all the measures of incidence and absolute numbers of people living in extreme poverty are very sensitive to both data and methodologies. Estimates using national accounts normally render up to half the poverty level rendered using household surveys.

on a broad international consensus. However, there are now well-grounded doubts about the possibility of really achieving them within the dates originally envisaged²⁴, and the consensus on the Millennium Goals is thus beginning to crumble. As a result, there is a need for further reflection on the mechanisms by which these goals can be effectively achieved, together with their reformulation based on an integral conception of the human beings.

1.2.3.3. *Insufficient and inefficient aid*

The aid that has been given to LDCs has fallen far short of the compromise of DCs to allocate 0.7% of their GNI (Gross National Income). In 2005, the average was as low as 0.33%²⁵. In contrast, 'The Millennium Goals can be financed within the bounds of the official development assistance that the donor countries have already promised' (Sachs, 2005, p. 299)²⁶. In addition, the aid that has been given has often been inefficiently distributed and utilized both by international organizations and by local governments and agencies, including even cases of corruption. We urgently need to think of new ways of getting

²⁴ Again, different estimates of poverty lead to very different assessments about the possibilities of fulfilling the Millennium Goals. Sala i Martin (2006) reckons that 60% of the goal of lowering income poverty in 2015 to half the level of 1990 (10%) was already fulfilled in the year 2000, when the poverty level was 7%.

²⁵ According to the latest data supplied by the OECD, in 2005 only 5 out of 22 members of the DAC (Development Assistance Committee, OECD) fulfilled the ODA's (Official Development Assistance) goal of 0.7%. They were Denmark (0.81), Luxembourg (0.82), the Netherlands (0.82), Norway (0.94) and Sweden (0.94).

²⁶ More than that, around 0.50% of GNI would be enough (*idem*).

the original goal of foreign aid from DCs to LDCs, to substantially increase its effectiveness and, at the same time, to convince the world's leaders that the national security of DCs will be much more difficult to obtain in a world with so much poverty and so few effective and widespread mechanisms of international solidarity.

1.2.3.4. *Mixed signals regarding convergence and the gaps*

In spite of the sustained rapid growth of many developing countries, signals of economic and social convergence between them and the developed ones are still confined to only a few countries, most of them in Asia and Southern Europe. This is not only the case at the economic level but it is also true in the very relevant field of education²⁷.

1.2.3.5. *Very uneven income distribution*

Globalization developments up to now appear associated with an increase in income inequality within most countries, even the most successful ones. *World* income distribution, instead, shows some positive signals mainly explained, as in the case of poverty, by the economic growth of Asia²⁸. When *wealth* is used instead of income to measure poverty differentials the unevenness of world distribution is astonishing. The richest 2% of adults own more than half the global wealth, and the Gini

²⁷ As it was analyzed in the seminar held by the Joint Working Group of the Pontifical Academies of Sciences and Social Sciences on *Globalization and Education*, November 2005. (http://www.vatican.va/roman_curia/pontifical_academies/acdscien/2006/PAS-es25_PASS-es6.pdf).

coefficient of this distribution is as high as 89%, i.e., a situation similar to one in which, in a group of 10 people, one of them gets \$1000 and the other nine get \$1 each²⁹. There is no information to analyze the evolution of this last gap over the time.

1.2.4. *The environment*

1.2.4.1. *New evidence and increased awareness of environmental deterioration*

Recent scientific reports³⁰, as well as their widespread reception in the media, testify an increased, worldwide awareness of the deterioration of our environment. These reports are not only referred to the very well known side of the question, i.e., global warming, but also include renewed concern over safe drinking water provision and the deterioration of urban and rural environments, particularly those in which the poor live. Unfortunately, this good news has not been accompanied by the completion of the signatures and mandates of the Kyoto Protocol.

²⁹ Davies *et al.* (2006). They estimate that average wealth per capita ranges, among big countries, from \$181,000 in Japan and 144,000 in the USA to \$1,400 in Indonesia or \$1,100 in India.

³⁰ Some important recent reports are Her Majesty's Treasury (Stern Report, 2006); The Pontifical Academy of Sciences (Water and the Environment, 2005); UNEP-WMO (Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change, 2007); United Nations (2006), United Nations Environment Program (2007). See also Partha Dasgupta (2002), 'Sustainable Development: Past Hopes and Present Realizations among the World's Poor', The Pontifical Academy of Social Sciences, Eighth Plenary Session, Vatican City.

1.2.5. *Challenges to local communities and cultural identities*

1.2.5.1. *Challenges from increased migrations and international trade and finances*

Many of the transformations brought about by globalization have beneficial effects for millions, even billions of people all around the world. It is also true, however, that some of these same transformations have disruptive effects on local communities and on cultural identities, as can be seen clearly in the case of increased international trade and migrations. Most of the time trade has positive effects in aggregate numbers, but it also has negative impacts on specific industries that are the sole, traditional source of employment and economic activity of many towns, cities or regions. This phenomenon is rather common in old manufacturing regions of different countries as well as in very poor rural zones of LDCs³¹. Increased external or internal migrations to attractive cities or regions, on the other hand, frequently have negative impacts on the employment level or on the ways of living of established populations. Both trade and migrations also pose new challenges for the cultural identities of the communities involved and of the migrants themselves. Good policies of local development can help deal with both challenges.

1.2.6. *Civilization clash or civilization change?*

Such is the scope and intensity of the changes that humankind is experiencing on the eve of this second millenni-

³¹ See the recent *Forum for Food Sovereignty*, Nyéléni, Mali, (www.nyeleni2007.org) as an interesting case of the reaction of poor farmers against the effects of commercial, capitalist agriculture on their traditional ways of producing and living.

um that a deep question spontaneously arises. Are we witnessing a civilization-wide transformation, one that challenges many of the Western values and institutions we have been used to living with and that have also been the traditional subjects of our thoughts and speeches? A preliminary answer could be affirmative. The emergence of Asian countries, with their own values, cultures and institutions; the serious threat confronted by the family as a key institution of humankind; the completely new roles of women, young people and the growing number of elders; the sort of demographic suicide of many Western countries where raising children is becoming rarer and rarer; the not less serious challenges confronted by the national state; the threats coming from an environment that sends us more and more signals that the current style of development looks almost impossible to sustain and, overall, to carry over to all peoples and nations. In spite of being overwhelming, this list of signs is perhaps still incomplete but at the same time enough to send us the message that a civilization-wide change is ongoing. Many of the problems we confront and the uneasiness we feel are not just consequences of globalization, but the expression of deeper trends of change in human history.

2. MAIN OUTCOMES OF THE PREVIOUS WORK OF THE ACADEMY ON GLOBALIZATION³²

2.1. *Introduction: drivers, traits and ethical consequences. The challenges of globalization and their relationship with the Social Doctrine of the Church*

2.1.1. *Critical challenges in a world that is really global for the first time in human history*

The world we live in is really global for the first time in human history, and we confront universal issues to resolve which neither war nor unilateral decisions nor the balance of powers are enough. We are witnessing the beginning of the self-socializing of all humankind. Violence and war, poverty and environmental degradation are the three main challenges we face. The three of them can be clearly seen, acting together, in the uncontrollable megalopolis of the developing countries. A structural divide is plaguing our national and international communities and it manifests itself in the economy, in society, in our different cultures and their encounters and conflicts, in rural-urban dichotomies and in the tensions between human beings and their natural environment.

³² Only the quotations belonging to the Popes are explicitly referred to. Acronyms of the encyclicals and other texts from the Popes are the following. PT, *Pacem in Terris* (HH John XXIII); PP, *Populorum Progressio* (HH Paul VI); CA, *Centesimus Annus*, and SRS, *Sollicitudo Rei Socialis* (HH John Paul II); DCE (*Deus Caritas Est*); PASS, *Papal Addresses to the Pontifical Academy of Social Sciences*.

2.1.2. *What kind of globalization?*

Globalization cannot and should not be arrested, but a central question remains open: what kind of development will the current globalization finally generate: elitist, dependency-inducing, culturally destructive, socially disruptive, personally alienating and environmentally damaging? Or, conversely, participatory, emancipating and liberating for the many, serving as a dynamic catalyst of regenerated cultural vitalities, conducive to social cooperation if not placid harmony, and environmentally sound in the long-term?

2.1.3. *Excessive predominance of economic forces*

Since 1989 humanity has entered a new phase in which the market economy seems to have conquered virtually the entire world often eluding the traditional regulations of the nation-states and predominating over concern for the common good (HH JP II, PASS, 2001 and 2003).

2.1.4. *Marginalization of the needy*

Globalization can subject entire peoples and cultures to a new, formidable struggle for survival, as well as to increased insecurities in every field of human activity: everyday life, labor, finances, the economy, politics, culture, health and the environment.

2.1.5. *Globalization's actors and democracy*

People's growing consciousness about inequalities can give place to extreme reactions such as excessive nationalism, religious fanaticism and even terrorism. Business has become the most powerful institution of the planet, even substituting traditional political institutions, and a large constellation of other

development actors refuses to accept this new role. At the same time, there are signals of a positive role of globalization in enhancing democratic development, law-based states, human rights and international law.

2.1.6. *Threats to cultural identities and new roles for religions*

Globalization appears to be eroding cultural diversity and vitality and making difficult the effectiveness of the right of every people to define its own development paradigm. In spite of predictions about its 'death', religion is still alive, demanded and used as a source of identities, and called upon to have a public role.

2.1.7. *Regionalization*

Parallel to the development of globalization and the weakening of the national states, there is a growing trend towards an increase in the autonomy of sub-national units as well as in the proliferation of multinational regional associations.

2.1.8. *International migrations*

It appears as if the 'rich' must begin to defend themselves from the 'poor', whose increasing international migrations are the result of the combination of the negative demographic curve in industrialized countries and the imbalances in social and economic wealth among countries and regions within countries.

2.1.9. *Globalization and corruption*

Whereas the law-based state has extended its tentacles over all the spheres of human action, illegal activities have been increasing at the same time in a variety of forms such as trafficking in women and children, corruption, organized crime, drug trafficking and tax evasion.

2.1.10. *Globalization and the environment*

The livelihoods of at least half a billion people are already under direct threat due to environmental degradation. Proper accounting for human and natural capital makes substantial differences in our conception of the development process as it shows, when applied, that the poorest regions of the world, like the Indian sub-continent and sub-Saharan Africa, comprising something like a third of the world's population, have become even poorer over the past decades³³.

2.2. *The Social Doctrine of the Church*

2.2.1. *The contribution of the Social Doctrine of the Church*

All along the last century, modern Christian culture has made decisive contributions to democracy and social justice, not least because it has always espoused a healthy distrust towards all those ideologies which proposed 'the new man'.

2.2.2. *The two faces of globalization*

The ethical implications of globalization can be either positive or negative. Among the latter, absolutizing the economy, economizing the whole human life and commoditizing everything are perhaps the most risky.

2.2.3. *Globalization, the human person and the priority of ethics*

There is a need for guidelines that will place globalization firmly at the service of authentic human development – the

³³ This statement refers to a long period that only partially includes the recent acceleration of economic growth in countries like India.

development of every person and of the whole person – in full respect of the rights and dignity of all (HH JP II, *PASS*, 2003).

2.2.4. *Humanity called to be a single, ethically founded family*

Globalization also offers exceptional and promising opportunities in the building of humanity as a single family, based on the values of justice, equity and solidarity (HH JP II, *Peace Day*, 2000).

2.2.5. *The preferential option for the poor*

We must reaffirm our preferential option for the poor. It remains ethically impossible to accept that the fate of human beings otherwise equal in all their capacities is nevertheless determined so much by the location and circumstances of their birth. Instead, there is a deep moral imperative for true equality in opportunities and we must recognize as a valid international objective that all human beings be given equal chances at birth. The needy have a right to the superfluous goods of the wealthy. There is a patent contradiction between the theoretical acceptance of the idea of justice and the practical acceptance of injustices.

2.2.6. *Universal common good and the governance of globalization*

Because of the worldwide dimension of the problems confronted, the constitution of a public authority with universal competence and oriented towards a universal common good centered in the human person is needed (HH John XXIII, *Pacem in Terris*). Now is the time ‘to work together for a new constitutional organization of the human family’, an organization that would be in a position to meet the new demands of a globalized world. This does not mean creating a ‘global super-

state', but continuing the processes already underway to increase democratic participation and promote political transparency and accountability in international institutions (HH JPII, *PASS*, 2003).

2.2.7. Respect for cultural diversity and intermediary groups

Globalization must respect cultural diversity which, within the universal harmony of peoples, is life's interpretive key (HH JPII, *PASS*, 2001).

2.2.8. Worldwide nature of the social question, globalization in solidarity, integral human development and the role of freedom

The social question had become worldwide by its very nature and answers to it must be found in a new vision of integral development, which 'fosters each man and the whole man' (HH Paul VI, *PP*). Thanks to their freedom, human beings will strive to overstep existing boundaries, particularly state or knowledge ones, and globalization has the potential to increase any kind of exchanges based on the principle of freedom.

2.2.9. Risks of absolutizing the economy and the roles of the market and of the private sector

The economy is only one aspect and one dimension of the whole of human activity. If economic life is absolutized the reason is to be found in the fact that the entire sociocultural system has been weakened, and ends up limiting itself to the production of goods and services alone (HH JPII, *CA*). On the level of individual nations and of international relations, it would appear that free market is the most efficient instrument for utilizing resources and effectively responding to needs. But this is true

only for those needs which are 'solvent', and there are many human needs which find no place on the market. It is the strict duty of justice and truth not to allow fundamental human needs to remain unsatisfied and not to allow those burdened by such needs to perish. It is also necessary to help these needy people to acquire expertise, to enter the cycle of exchange and to develop their skills in order to make the best use of their capacities and resources (HH JP II, CA). For the social teaching of the Church, private property (including the intellectual one) 'is under a "social mortgage", which means that it has an intrinsically social function, based upon and justified precisely by the principle of the universal destination of goods' (HH JP II, SRS).

2.2.10. Developing and developed countries and the crucial role of international trade

Recent experience has shown that countries isolated from the world markets have suffered stagnation and recession, while the countries which experienced development were those which succeeded in taking part in the general interrelated economic activities at the international level (HH JP II, CA).

2.2.11. Indebtedness of developing countries

The principle that debts must be paid is certainly just. However, it is not right to demand or expect payment when the effect would be the imposition of political choices leading to hunger and despair for entire peoples. In such cases it is necessary to find ways to lighten, defer or even cancel the debt, in line with the fundamental right of peoples to subsistence and progress (HH JP II, CA).

2.3. *Recent Developments of the Social Doctrine of the Church: the Encyclical Deus Caritas Est and other teachings of Pope Benedict XVI*

2.3.1. Deus Caritas Est³⁴

The Pope's first encyclical has important implications. In particular, it reminds us that the theological and human virtue of charity must preside over all of the social teaching and all of the social works of the Church and her members. First of all, this encyclical leads us to the truth that 'God is love'. Thus the Pope declares that 'Jesus united into a single precept this commandment of love for God and the commandment of love for neighbor'. The Pope draws our attention to the fact that this teaching is both timely and significant 'In a world where the name of God is sometimes associated with vengeance or even a duty of hatred and violence'. This is why *Deus Caritas Est* (*DCE*) has been correctly described as being in part a social encyclical. It is love (*caritas*) that animates the Church's care for the needy, the work of lay women and men for justice and peace in the secular sphere, and is the leavening force of the Church in society. And without love, as Paul told the Corinthians, our words and works will come to nothing.

Indeed, *DCE* places itself in the long lineage of other social encyclicals (cf. n. 27), not only because it addresses the virtue of charity but also because it attributes primary importance to the virtue of justice. Indeed, it makes a highly significant reference to a famous statement on this virtue by one of the great figures

³⁴ This section has been taken from the booklet of the XIII Plenary Session of the Pontifical Academy of Social Sciences, written by its Chancellor, Msgr. Marcelo Sánchez Sorondo.

of Tradition: 'As Augustine once said, a state which is not governed according to justice would be just a bunch of thieves: "*Remota itaque iustitia quid sunt regna nisi magna latrocinia?*"'. Taking into consideration traditional philosophical-political doctrines and also (in a critical way) the Marxist demand for a fair distribution of goods by public powers, Benedict XVI declares: 'In today's complex situation, not least because of the growth of a globalized economy, the Social Doctrine of the Church has become a set of fundamental guidelines offering approaches that are even beyond the confines of the Church: in the face of ongoing development these guidelines need to be addressed in the context of dialogue with all those seriously concerned for humanity and for the world in which we live' (n. 27).

When discussing the relationship between the Church, a 'Community of Love', and politics, the Pope's approach to justice is particularly relevant to the social sciences and to the role of the Magisterium of the Church. First of all, the Pope offers one of the strongest visions that have ever been formulated in the contemporary age on the relationship between politics and justice: 'The just ordering of society and the state is a central responsibility of politics'. Indeed, 'Justice is both the aim and the intrinsic criterion of all politics'. For the Pope justice (and politics) is not a mere utilitarian or contractual technique but 'by its very nature has to do with ethics' (n. 28). In contrast to the solely descriptive and value-free understanding of human action proposed by many within the human and social sciences, the Pope upholds the importance of practical reason by renewing the question of the fairest political order. However, he perceives the modern danger of detaching reason from faith: 'if reason is to be exercised properly, it must undergo constant purification, since it can never be completely free of the danger of a certain ethical blindness caused by the dazzling effect of power and special interests'. Indeed, we cannot but engage in an assessment of

our sense of justice in the light of faith: 'From God's standpoint, faith liberates reason from its blind spots and therefore helps it to be ever more fully itself'. This critical work of faith frees reason from its limits: 'Faith enables reason to do its work more effectively and to see its proper object more clearly'. Not only the historical dimension of the meaning of justice, founded on both the Jewish and Christian traditions and the Roman and Greek inheritance, but also its contemporary meaning, derive from the constant purification that faith brings to reason: 'This is where Catholic social doctrine has its place: it has no intention of giving the Church power over the state. Even less is it an attempt to impose on those who do not share the faith ways of thinking and modes of conduct proper to faith'.

In Christian social teaching, Charity encompasses all duties. Thus it entails justice. Without charity justice can become blind and partial. Charity instead continuously refuels justice without depriving it of its proper nature, which consists in guaranteeing to each person what he/she owes. But charity will never be ruled out by justice alone, because, 'in addition to justice man needs, and will always need, love' (*DCE*). In conclusion, here too the Pope attributes to the Christian a fundamental task and stresses that the aim of the social doctrine of the Church 'is simply to help purify reason and to contribute, here and now, to the acknowledgement and attainment of what is just' (n. 28a). The Holy Father, in conformity with this teaching on charity and justice, thus calls for the structures of charitable service in the social context of the present day to promote the wellbeing of individuals, of peoples and of humanity: 'Our times call for a new readiness to assist our neighbors in need...Concern for our neighbor transcends the confines of national communities and has increasingly broadened its horizon to the whole world' (n. 30).

2.3.2. *Other teachings of Pope Benedict XVI*

A. Jesus of Nazareth³⁵

HH Benedict XVI teaches us some of the theological roots of the SDCh in his recently published book *Jesus of Nazareth*. Particularly relevant to the questions we are dealing with here is the one referred to the Good Samaritan parable (Luke, 10:25-37). ‘The story of the Good Samaritan concerns the fundamental human question. A lawyer – a master of exegesis, in other words – poses this question to the Lord: “Teacher, what shall I do to inherit eternal life?” Luke comments that the scholar addresses this question to Jesus in order to put him to the test. Being a Scripture scholar himself, he knows how the Bible answers his question... The Lord very simply refers him to the Scripture, which of course he knows, and gets him to give the answer himself. The scholar does so by combining Deuteronomy 6:5 and Leviticus 19:18, and he is right on target: “You shall love the Lord your God with all your heart, and with all your soul, and with all your strength, and with all your mind; and your neighbor as yourself”. Jesus’ teaching on this question is not different from that of the Torah, the entire meaning of which is contained in this double commandment... The concrete question is who is meant by neighbor... Now that the question has been focused in this way, Jesus answers it with the parable of the man on the way from Jerusalem to Jericho who falls among robbers, is stripped of everything, and then is left lying half dead on the roadside... One thing is clear: *A new universality is entering in the scene*, and it rests on the fact that deep within I am already becoming a brother to all those I meet who are in need of my help (emphasis added). The topical relevance of the parable is evident. When we transpose it into the dimensions of world society, we see how the peoples of Africa, lying robbed and plundered, matter to

³⁵ Joseph Ratzinger, Pope Benedict XVI (2007), *Jesus of Nazareth*.

us. Then we see how deeply they are our neighbors; that our lifestyle, the history in which we are involved, has plundered them and continues to do so. This is true above all in the sense that we have wounded their souls. Instead of giving them God, the God who has come close to us in Christ, which would have integrated and brought to completion all that is precious and great in their own traditions, we have given them the cynicism of a world without god in which all that counts is power and profit, a world that destroys moral standards so that corruption and the unscrupulous will to gain power are taken for granted. And that applies not only to Africa. We do of course have material assistance to offer and we have to examine our own way of life. But we always give too little when we just give material things. And aren't we surrounded by people who have been robbed and battered? The victims of drugs, of human trafficking, of sex tourism, inwardly devastated people who sit empty in the midst of material abundance. All this is of concern to us, it urges us to have the eye and the heart of a neighbor, and to have the courage to love our neighbor, too... Everyone is "alienated", especially from love (which, after all, is the essence of the "supernatural splendor" of which we have been despoiled); everyone must first be healed and filled with God's gifts. But then everyone is also called to become a Samaritan – to follow Christ and become like him. When we do that, we live rightly. We love rightly when we become like him, who loved all of us first' (cf. I Jn 4:19)³⁶.

B. *Letter to the President of the European Union and of the G7*

HH Benedict XVI showed a clear perception of these renewed responsibilities in his December 2007 letter to Chancellor Merkel, who was, at that time, president of the European Union and of the

³⁶ *Op. cit.*, pp. 194-201.

G7. He congratulated the Chancellor for keeping the question of global poverty on the agenda (particularly regarding Africa), a question that deserves 'the highest attention and priority for the sake of poor and rich countries alike. Governments of poorer countries have a responsibility with regard to good governance... but the active involvement of international partners is indispensable... This is not an "extra" or a concession: it is a grave and unconditional moral responsibility founded on the unity of the human race and on the common dignity and shared destiny of rich and poor alike'. The Pope also asked that 'trade conditions favorable to poor countries, including broad and unconditional access to markets, should be made available and guaranteed' and requested the 'cancellation of the external debt of HIPC and of the LDCs and measures to ensure that they do not fall once again in similar situations'. He also wrote that developed countries must recognize and implement fully their commitments with regard to external aid and must make substantial investments in medical R&D to treat AIDS, tuberculosis, malaria and other tropical diseases, making available medical and pharmaceutical technologies without imposing legal or economic conditions. He also called for the substantial reduction of both legal and illegal arms trade, illegal trade of precious raw materials, capital flights from LDCs and money-laundering. He also manifested his conviction that eradicating extreme poverty by the year 2015 is one of the most important tasks in today's world and that such an objective is indissolubly linked to world peace and security.

2.4. Globalization, poverty and the gaps

2.4.1. Lights and shadows regarding globalization and old and new poverties

Social and economic progress in most of the developing countries during the last decades is beyond any doubt. But it is

also very clear that the benefits of globalization are unevenly distributed and that globalization limits the ability of governments to promote human development and fight poverty because of the fiscal squeeze it has imposed on countries through reductions in expenditures and tax competition. Human poverty has been reduced, but not as fast as it should be required and it is in any measure still high. In the particular case of Africa, near fifty percent of its people live in absolute poverty.

2.4.2. *Globalization and the gaps*

Up to the end of the last century the majority of poor countries did not grow faster than the rich ones and there were no clear signals of convergence or divergence between the two groups. Excluding a handful of Asian and Southern Europe success stories, divergence has tended to prevail and the middle class of countries has reduced in size during the 20th century. World distribution of personal income is very unequal, the participation in the immaterial side of civilization is very unequal too and the IT revolution has created an additional gap between developed and developing countries. The gulf between wealth and poverty is intensifying not only between some rich countries and the developing ones but also within each of them.

2.4.3. *Hypotheses about the gaps*

It is not clear whether economic and social inequalities have stagnated or increased *because of* globalization. But as a result of the communications revolution, inequalities and poverty have become increasingly intolerable. A particular problem is found in some of the least developed countries, in which economic transactions occur among members of communitarian institutions, neither markets nor the state, and in which the expansion of markets can destroy these non market institutions, making certain

vulnerable groups worse off. Freeing trade without considering safety-nets for those who are vulnerable to the erosion of communitarian practices is defective policy. Other relevant factors that can explain the gaps are protectionism and subsidies to agriculture and other sectors in DCs; unfairness in some aspects of patents and intellectual property; insufficient institutional development, as manifested by political instability, lack of independent justice, inefficient public expenditure, and also demagoguery and unpunished corruption; and brain drain from LDCs to DCs, in sharp contrast with restrictions on international migrations of less qualified labor from LDCs to DCs³⁷. Global income inequality is a product of insufficient international cooperation, as proved by protectionism and tax competition, both of which are obstacles on the way to less poverty and more equity.

2.4.4. *Poverty, equity and the Millennium Goals*

a) *Current situation.* There has been some progress in achieving the Millennium Goals, but the situation is still very serious in Sub Saharan Africa and in other countries like Haiti. A baby who is born now in Montreal (Canada) has an almost 50% chance of getting a university diploma, while one born in Ouagadougou (Burkina Faso) only has a 0.6% chance. The threshold currently in use for the definition of poverty needs to be reconsidered, as well as the ways to accurately measure this increasingly important indicator. b) *The case of Africa.* In the case of Africa, three main explanations can be given for the non

³⁷ These restrictions are also sharply in contrast with the freedom enjoyed by European and Asian countries at the end of the 19th century and the beginning of the 20th century, when millions of emigrants from these continents were welcomed in America and Africa.

performance of the Millennium Goals: lack of enough human capital, infrastructure deficiencies and problems of governance. But besides internal conditions there have also been problems with the effective levels, quality and targeting of the aid, as well as with public or foreign debt burdens. Some of the big questions of this new century are: were the resources of countries in Sub Saharan Africa not been plundered in the colonial era? How poor did the collusions between rich countries and African despots make Sub Saharan Africa? Because of this doubt, the question of reparation should be treated *pari passu* with the debt one. *c) Trade and regional blocks.* International regional integrations can play a very important role in the fight against poverty. However, very fast openness to trade can also have a negative effect on the levels of poverty, while emigrants' remittances can play a positive role. *d) The role of poor countries in fighting against poverty.* Even poor countries should take the lead in improving world governance and fighting against poverty. They should also look for complementary and alternative ways to help themselves. A concrete way of doing this is to be more confident of their own strengths. *e) The omitted role of the family.* Family is not even mentioned in the Millennium Goals. Taking into account that issues referred to education, health and gender equality are at the core of these Goals, the omission of the family is a serious mistake.

2.5. *Globalization, cultural identities, the role of religions and of inter-religious dialogue*

2.5.1. *Globalization and cultural identities*

Regarding this very complex phenomenon, it is possible to identify, at the same time, tendencies promising global uniformity and other ones protecting and protracting cultural diversity. In the

process, it sometimes appears that globalization flattens cultural diversity, ruins civilizations, excludes the ones judged as undesirable, including poor ones, and accelerates the disarticulation of social bonds which bind people's allegiances to their national, regional, and local communities. This happens in DCs too, because of the negative effects of globalization on wages and employment levels in many regions. At the same time, globalization is a potentially positive phenomenon as far as it tends to unify humankind and to pass from a history of conflictive tribes to a history of the whole of humanity. Influences from the global world have different manifestations. Sometimes, they are perceived as desirable, generating pressure towards syncretism. Alternatively, they can be perceived as negative, in a competitive contradiction with the local hegemonic culture, potentially leading to fundamentalism. Finally, there are cases of 'compatibility', where global influences are welcomed, giving place to the globalized uniformity thesis. A 'politics of identity' cannot be simplistically construed in terms of traditionalism versus globalization. Syncretism and cultural elaboration means that there is an increasing array of identities, which can be assumed both locally and worldwide, and which increase the complexity of the tasks of every social institution especially those of law, politics, education, and religion.

2.5.2. Respect for cultural diversity and the role of education

In the context of globalization educational processes are essential in the building of respect for cultural diversity and preservation of the elements of cultural identity. New generations have to understand in a clear way their own culture in relation to other cultures in order to develop self-awareness when facing cultural changes and to promote peaceful understanding and tolerance, thereby identifying and encouraging true human values within an intercultural perspective.

2.5.3. *Religious identities*

Globalization is leading to the blurring of international borders and giving birth to a sort of crisis of religious identities. It is a mistake to identify Christianity with the Western World. Dialogue, politics, truth and peace are inseparable. Religions give more life to the interpretive keys that are crucial to understand the world we live in. The challenge is to integrate the identity and the universal dimensions of the religious experience.

2.5.4. *The role of religions and of inter-religious dialogue*

The guidelines of the Social Doctrine of the Church need to be addressed in the context of a dialogue with all those seriously concerned about humanity and about the world we live in. There cannot be peace among nations without peace among religions. Peace presupposes dialogue and dialogue is the only possible alternative to a 'clash of civilizations'. Most religions see their common obligation to work together for justice and peace and for the promotion of our common values. It is possible to broaden our experience of the Divine through inter-religious dialogue. Global solidarity already in practice in some measure among several Church entities could be enhanced to strengthen a movement of thought, inquiry and action, inspired by God, and whose purpose should be to develop modes of action to contribute to the building of an alternative culture to the one imposed by the sole forces of economic globalization, which fragments body, mind and spirit; alienates people from the respect for the Creation; and atomizes families, communities and the global community itself. The five qualities for a successful inter-religious dialogue are truth, freedom, justice, prayer and love, the latter as manifested in solidarity, forgiveness and reconciliation. If you want peace, go to meet the poor (JPPII,

Message, 1993). It is naive to believe that the solution of the Middle East conflict will suffice to overcome terrorism or to avoid wars in other parts of the world. But it has a crucial symbolic meaning and will help give a territorial, not a religious character to other related or potentially related conflicts. The contribution of religious leaders to the solution of the Middle East conflict is, for those reasons, crucial. In the case of Lebanon, eighteen religious communities have peacefully lived together many years, even reaching a constitutional agreement that can be called a co-associative democracy. We need to set aside the past, to make better and sincere efforts to reach mutual understanding and to promote together social justice, moral values, peace and freedom for all humankind.

2.6. *Globalization and Migrations*

2.6.1. *Migrations intensity*

Globalization has provoked an unprecedented increase in migrant populations. Migration is a very old phenomenon, perhaps 6,000 years old. But it now involves unprecedented amounts of people. Half a million people are leaving Latin America and the USA is receiving one million immigrants every year. Remittances from immigrants to their relatives amount to around 300 B US\$.

2.6.2. *Migrations and education*

Today international migration is an integral part of global development. It can be an extremely positive factor as regards mutual understanding and the mixing of cultures. Education plays an important role in the integration of the children of immigrants worldwide. While some of the children of immi-

grant families do better at school than the children of indigenous families, others seem to be earmarked early on for social rejection and the experiencing of problems. Reducing the fracture with native cultures and languages, and helping maintain family stability, are among some of the paths by which to achieve improvements in this area.

2.6.3. *Migrations and citizenships*

a) *The current model of citizenship*, Western, democratic and exported *urbi et orbi* is basically Hobbesian and its latest formulation is that of *lib-lab* (liberal-labor). This model cannot work without recognizing the cultural identity and the basic role of intermediate bodies in political participation and in decision-making on the issue of citizenship. But we are living in a society of fear and there is the risk of falling into the Hobbesian temptation. At the same time, the Hobbesian model of citizenship is undergoing a crisis because globalization has reduced national states' sovereignty. b) *Cosmopolitan citizenship*. We need to give priority to social rights over political rights associated to the question of citizenship. This way it would be possible to create a *post-Hobbesian citizenship* with reference to a *cosmopolitan citizenship* differentiated from the *national* one, as well as from a *globalized citizenship*. This new citizenship can be built based on a positive anthropology (not a negative one, as in Hobbes), at the service of the general interests and recognizing cultural identities (including religious ones) as well as core social networks. This could allow us to build a subsidiary, societal, relational and plural citizenship able to integrate immigrants.

2.7. *Globalization and education*

2.7.1. *Globalization, cultural interdependence and the values of the spirit*

‘A third challenge relates to the values of the spirit. Pressed by economic worries, we tend to forget that, unlike material goods those spiritual goods which are properly human expand and multiply when communicated: unlike divisible goods, spiritual goods such as knowledge and education are indivisible, and the more one shares them, the more they are possessed. Globalization has increased the interdependence of peoples, with their different traditions, religions and systems of education. This means that the peoples of the world, for all their differences, are constantly learning about one another and coming into much greater contact. All the more important, then, is the need of a dialogue which can help people to understand their own traditions vis-à-vis those of others, to develop greater self-awareness in the face of challenges to their identity, and thus to promote understanding and the acknowledgment of true human values within an intercultural perspective. To meet these challenges, a just equality of opportunity, especially in the field of education and the transmission of knowledge, is urgently needed. Regrettably, education, especially at the primary level, remains dramatically insufficient in many parts of the world’ (HH Benedict XVI, *PASS*, 2007).

2.7.2. *The aims of education*

Education should aim at the full development of the human person, the promotion of the meaning of human dignity, and the strengthening of respect for human rights and fundamental freedoms. It should enable all persons to participate effectively in the human family and should advance understanding, friend-

ship, and cooperation between all peoples, ethnic groups and religious communities. Education should also transmit knowledge, higher-order cognitive skills and the interpersonal sensibilities required to help boys, girls, men and women to become fully themselves and to interact with others. It should develop their ability to observe, to reason, to synthesise and create ethical values, and to develop a sense of justice, respect, tolerance, and compassion for others. It should emphasize the responsibility of people to protect the environment for the benefit of present and future generations, preventing pollution and ecological deterioration and promoting conservation and sustainable development. In its transmission of knowledge and its fostering of creativity, education should convey the deep lessons of the past and communicate the opportunities and risks that will be faced by humanity in the future.

2.7.3. Globalization, education and peace

At the same time, education should aim to establish that common sense of humanity which is essential for the maintenance of peace. This could be achieved by drawing on the universality of ethical principles and norms, which are, for instance, expressed in the concepts of human rights and the dignity of the person, as well as on the universality of knowledge, wisdom and science. It is thus also necessary to offer at some point in the educational process the new image of the universe that the scientific community has proposed, of the cosmos, the earth, life, and the emergence of humans and their societies. A properly managed globalization may provide a chance for education and peace, bringing human beings closer to one another and fostering the sharing of common values. Such an endeavour must be accomplished within the context of the diversity and interdependence of cultures and the universality of religious, anthropo-

logical and ethical values, which increasingly intersect with communication and information technology, as well as with the new patterns of international migration.

2.7.4. Education, relativism and nihilism

The relativist and nihilistic tendencies of some modern movements, which Benedict XVI and his predecessors have criticised with increasing force, have been matched by a welcome and progressive return of ethical, philosophical and religious questions. The ‘wonder’ that stimulated the origin of science and the path taken by science has not diminished but increased with the new discoveries in the physical and life sciences. This ‘new world’, which has been increasingly investigated by man, has given rise to even greater amazement at the universe which could open up a new positive horizon of meaning by which to understand the mystery of the Creation. In this way, as a result of science, religion and philosophy have returned to the fore, as is demonstrated by the increasing attention paid to their recognised roles in their quest for the truth. From this springs the need to take into account science, philosophy and religion in establishing a sound anthropological basis as the pre-condition of education today.

2.7.5. Globalization, education and justice

In our globalized world, the problem of justice is central: namely that all men and women, wherever they are and whatever their condition of life, should have the right to, and the possibility of, a good education and general access to culture. This means achieving the goal of basic education – up to nine years – for all, then secondary and higher education on the basis of abilities and resources. For all people today there is a tremendous

wealth of knowledge which is unparalleled in history and which should be made available through new and suitable processes of synthesis and transmission. However, in spite of the many declarations and statements of objectives, enunciated by the United Nations and other agencies, and despite significant efforts in some countries, education remains extraordinarily uneven within the world population, although the resources needed to improve this situation do not seem to be out of reach. A special cause for concern over the last decade has been divergence and growing inequality, which is concomitant with globalization and related to policies in education, between developed or emerging countries and stagnating ones, the latter being caught in a poverty trap. *a) School quality.* An important cause for concern is the wide and frequently increasing quality gap between the schools attended by the poor and the schools attended by those who are not poor. This happens in such a way that differentiated or segregated educational pathways often emerge. Most alarming is the fact that worldwide nearly 200 million children and young people who should be receiving basic education are not enrolled in school at all. *b) Educational policies.* In the face of global migrations, the explosion of knowledge and the concomitant emergence of a knowledge-intensive economy, and above all the compelling obligation to fight poverty by all means throughout the world, education may require serious re-thinking. Adverse consequences of inadequate education policies for poor people could be amplified by globalization. *c) Classical education, skills and abilities.* Human development depends upon multiple parameters such as education, health, and cultural visions of the family and of the respective roles of men and women in human society. The 'classic' basic skills expected of primary education – reading, writing and arithmetic – are no longer sufficient in a globalized world. They need to be supplemented by skills leading towards such objectives as the improvement, protection or

preservation of work abilities, cultural and linguistic heritage, ethical values, social cohesion, and the environment. In the future, the classic triad may expand into a new objective: ‘reading, writing, mathematics, reasoning, synthesising’.

2.7.6. Education and the family

Education begins in the maternal womb and at birth. Mothers, fathers and families in their primary educational role need help to understand – in the new global context – the importance of this early stage in life, and should be prepared to act accordingly. One of the critical paths to a higher quality of education at the school level is the increased participation of families and local communities in the governance of their educational projects.

2.7.7. Education and teachers

Teaching requires on behalf of teachers a high level of knowledge so that students, who learn through the process of instruction, may achieve a standard of education that they would not obtain on their own. Their role as agents of education has to be recognized and supported by all possible means: for example, continuous coaching by those who have a more direct access to knowledge (especially trained scholars and scientists), updating of professional training, suitable salaries, and the availability of information technologies. In order to facilitate a successful educational process, and so as to provide every member of society, and communities themselves, with that level of knowledge and learning which is a primary factor in conferring autonomy and encouraging co-operation, it is important to aim for high standards of quality within the teaching profession, especially at the level of higher education. This is also required so that, given that the expertise of every teacher is limited, what a student does

not learn from one teacher he or she may learn from another, and so that teachers may learn from each other within a context of synergy. To support and promote this dual process, which is at the origin of schools, universities and other educational institutions, suitable national, international and private resources must be made available to them so that, throughout the world, they can carry out their tasks in an effective way.

2.7.8. Education, communication and information technologies (IT)

Communication and information technology (IT) offers extraordinary opportunities for the renewal of education because of its capacity to connect people, its ability to promote the accessibility of remote areas, its decreasing costs, and the potential volume of the information it can convey. It will thus be possible to reduce the costs of education for each child, even in poor areas. However, IT tools do not necessarily achieve education on their own. They need to be accompanied by a conceptual vision in order to promote dialogue, the active participation of teachers, the organisation of knowledge, and an awareness of the importance of values.

2.8. The civil society and the role of charities

2.8.1. Globalization, culture and the role of communities

Without a sustainable culture there is no sustainable community and without a sustainable community there is no sustainable globalization. From humanistic development in the sixties, to the disenchantment with foreign aid, to the conditional lending of international financial institutions, to birth control, to schooling (important, but not enough), all of these approaches to eliminate poverty have proved insufficient. Participative approaches are

important, but costly, and social capital is not enough either. It cannot be taken for granted that 'the rural community' retains the patrimony of the commons that is crucial for the viability of a strategy of partnership. Common values or normative consensus cannot be treated as a given – factions and fragmentation often make these frail foundations upon which to build. Developments at the *meso level* seem imperative; otherwise we, and, more importantly they, the people, are left with a yawning gap between a small, limited and defenceless local project and the *macro level* Leviathans (national or international).

2.8.2. *The role of charities*

A successful role for charities must be based on dialogue, operating subject's consciousness, project sustainability, a real appreciation of local human resources, flexibility and the promotion of partnership. The action of the NGOs must interact with a renewed approach to development cooperation by integrating it into a comprehensive policy towards LDCs and into foreign affairs policies too, eliminating tied aid and increasing the aid level.

2.8.3. *Approaches to the fight against poverty*

A call to action requires programs that will bring about the following shifts: from material poverty to adequate assets and livelihoods; from isolation and poor infrastructure to access and service; from illness and incapability to health, information and education; from unequal and troubled gender relations to equity and harmony; from fear and lack of protection to peace and security; from exclusion and impotence to inclusion, organization and empowerment; from corruption and abuse to honesty and fair treatment.

2.8.4. *The third sector and authentic social movements in developing countries*

Local initiatives cannot even rely upon hiding behind the skirts of the *terzo settore* charity, which in itself is incapable of protecting them against such potential adversaries. The ‘third sector’ exists marginally and insecurely between the market and the state. It is true that we need to initiate from the bottom a new pro-justice movement. However, that only serves to pose a bigger question: what can be done to foster authentic social movements in developing countries – ones that are themselves sturdy enough to resist political incorporation by self-interested forces and to resist economic incorporation by equally self-interested market forces?

2.9. *The governance of globalization*

2.9.1. *Preliminaries for the governance of globalization*

2.9.1.1. *Weak governance*

We are experiencing a stage of weak governance, characterized both by an insufficient consideration of ethical issues and a prevalence of technical approaches. These have not been able to solve any of the most important challenges we are having, like war, trade or the environment, or an even more urgent and elementary task such as humanitarian aid. More than that, a mere technological approach is the one that underlines the idea of solving world problems with wars conceived as surgeries. Instead, conflicts and wars must be prevented through justice and integral development. So we need to escape from a technical approach and go into world governance based on ethics.

2.9.1.2. *The universal common good*

Globalization carries with it the obligation of defining a Universal Common Good and the necessity of worldwide public goods. One of the most important of these world public goods is the integral development of all countries and of all peoples. This is very difficult because economic globalization develops very rapidly, while global politics and governance go too slow.

2.9.1.3. *A chaos risk*

National institutions no longer suffice when seeking to establish the right order for a global world. But globalization bears a chaos risk, because of the erosion of the ordering and pacifying role of the national state and because of the deficits of international policy and the lacunas of international law. More international government carries the risk of institutionalizing 'bad' governments. There is no place for the crucial, civil society-government dialectical relationship at the world level. There is a big, dangerous gap developing between the global social space and the domains of particular entities. Global society is too weak and tentative to play that role. Lack of democracy at the international level is impeding the humanization of the global system ('to temper globalization'), contrary to what happened at the national level because of the development of democracy. Bargaining powers are different at the international level and, very frequently, governments did not represent their peoples, particularly the poor. *Subsidiarity* affirms the value of international institutions, but avoids uncritical acceptance of internationalism. It promotes freedom and integrity of local cultures, without reducing particularism to pure devolution.

2.9.1.4. *The question of a world government*

It is impossible to deny the impression of precariousness within the international order at the economic, juridical and political levels. Wars continue to break out and there is a shortage of effective and just global initiatives. The structures of the international milieu seem to resist any form of democratic control. On the threshold of the twenty-first century, global governance requires a new set of international ethical standards. Civil democracy founded upon public opinion, non-governmental institutions and the acceptance of the standards of international agreements constitutes one of the premises. Additionally, appropriate governance solutions should care to limit the weight of purely economic considerations. One of the main motivations for the *request for a world government* is the need to keep peace through binding international law and sanctions, and it is also connected with the notion of universal common good. It is utopian to think of it as a structured central government, but not if we think of a coordination of the decision-making process at the international level. World governance requires the participation of all the governmental levels – local, national, international – as well as a first class leadership. In this framework, an alternative concept to globalization can be envisaged, and it is universalization, emerging at the social, more than at the political level, as the proliferation of a lot of non-governmental organizations shows. It is possible to feel that the embryo of worldwide governance is developing, following a growing consciousness of a common responsibility. This can be seen in the recognition of the right to intervene, the legitimacy conferred to the UN Security Council, the institutionalization of world leaders' summits, the efforts towards a rational and joint management of the planet's resources, together with the preoccupation for a sustainable development and the establishment of a worldwide judiciary system – like the one put in place in the Inter-

national Criminal Court – in which all governments could be summoned. But power politics is still alive, and it seriously threatens all that has been done during the last twenty-five years to build an international order based on cooperation and consultation. Additionally, other reforms are yet to be performed to implement a better governance of globalization, like the reform of the UN and its economic institutions; putting in place new norms to regulate the environment, trade, finances, investments and the activities of trans-national corporations; the elaboration of a worldwide tax or fiscal system and the building of new relationships between civil society and the public and private sectors.

2.9.2. Towards a democratic international order

2.9.2.1. The nexus between the rule of international law and democracy

During much of the 20th century there has been a considerable widening and deepening in the scope of the international legal order. It has been beneficial to mankind and has made the world a better place to live for a large number of persons. But, given that the vocabulary of democracy is rooted in notions of *demos*, nation and state there is no easy conceptual template from the traditional array of democratic theories one can employ to meet the challenge. What is required is both a rethinking of the very building blocks of democracy to see how these may or may not be employed in an international system. One of the required normative challenges is to arrive at rules and structures that protect and assist the integrity of smaller units to seek their own ends in freedom, i.e., consistent with the idea of subsidiarity. But both subsidiarity and solidarity can only be intelligible principles if we can posit the existence of some universal *common good* among the peoples of the world.

2.9.2.2. *Crisis of the national states?*

Nation-states are neither obsolete entities of the past nor do they possess a monopoly on global agency. The question is that the economy has become global while politics has not. This has removed the stable linkage between state, territory, population, and wealth. The social control which globalization is eroding cannot be recovered at the level of the nation-states without protectionist repression or neo-mercantilist measures which would provoke a catastrophic crisis. To overcome the situation, a redefinition of the state is needed, understanding it as the result of peoples' sovereignty, one in which peoples are built up beyond individuals, in the local communities and in its values. In this perspective, 'think locally, act globally' means understanding the local as the place in which communities operate and act universally in a process that reconnect them to the human rights.

2.9.2.3. *An international citizenship and civil society?*

It does not seem possible to sustain a notion of citizenship when the bonds that were historically assumed as the source of citizenship get weaker and weaker. And it seems premature to speak of an 'international civil society', because in some cases it may serve to mask activities that severely threaten real democracy and other human values. In the building of stronger ties at the international level it seems convenient to avoid both a 'laissez-faire fundamentalism', leading to self-regulated systems, and a 'neo-statist' approach with a strong demand for regulation at the level of national government that would produce undesirable effects. Instead we should pursue a 'trans-national civil society strategy', entrusting its design to the 'intermediate bodies' of civil society, relying on social consensus rather than automatic market or bureaucratic mechanisms and, overall, based on the prin-

ciple of subsidiarity at the transnational level. Instead, we can see now a sudden and conjoint development of low social and low systemic integration at global level – always a combination with explosive potential. The high level of global systemic integration envisaged is simply incompatible with the prevalent low level of social integration. The key to global order is more likely to be found by exploring the conditions under which the ‘social’ and the ‘systemic’ might once again come to stand in a mutually regulatory relationship, at world level.

2.9.2.4. *Which values at the world level?*

In his October 1995 speech to the United Nations, Pope John Paul II spoke of a ‘legitimate pluralism’ in forms of freedom. The approving reference to ‘pluralism’ counsels against the ‘one right answer’ temptation. Thus, there is scope for many different versions of the democratic experiment. But to soundly speak about democracy and values the question is: where are values born? Values were traditionally born in stable elements of society, like families, local unions or professions, but all of them are changing rapidly and profoundly. So, where are values born and transmitted now in a rapidly changing society? On the other hand, it is important to understand that something morally essential to democracy is procedural neutrality and that it is the basis of constitutional protection for privacy as well as protection of minorities.

2.9.2.5. *International organizations and human rights*

Democratic advancement and human rights protection in the developing world have been assisted by international structures and the ideas behind them. The Western world, primarily rooted in Christianity, has contributed significantly to the devel-

opment of democracy. Even gender equality and the rights of minority communities are actually rooted in Christianity. At the political and legal levels, however, the UN globalization project looks more worrisome. It has developed a materialist and strictly evolutionist conception of the human being, discarding the realistic vision implicit in its 1948 Declaration.

2.9.2.6. *Governance of international institutions*

Unfortunately nothing is less democratic or less open to participation than some international institutions in which one single vote has a greater weight than that of the majority. Unless there are serious reforms in governance, the legitimacy of the institutions will be undermined; unless there are serious reforms in the practices, there may well be a backlash.

2.9.2.7. *Universal versus idiosyncratic institutions and the institutional weaknesses of LDCs*

Without the required improvements in national governance, the positive globalization-governance interaction will not be possible. The outcomes of an unfair globalization are not limited to the economy or to social life, but they also reach the field of politics. On the macro side, the emergence and probability of success of nationalistic ideologies and movements are very frequently associated with bad economic or social performance. On the micro side, when people cannot have access to legal ways of life, the probability of illegal behavior is really higher. 'Quality of government' has historically meant: legitimate and deep rooted origin, fiscal correspondence, rule of law, accountability, societal control and law enforcement. Outward orientation, either regional or international, can play a very important role as a quality enhancer for domestic institutions and growth.

2.9.2.8. *Regional integration processes*

European and American integration processes have reflected a democratic decision of peoples based upon the big tragedies of the 20th century. The role of external peer pressure was in some cases shown to be powerful to reduce corruption. The question of legitimacy can be resolved at the national level but great problems remain at the international level. *a) Africa.* Because of a dualistic economy and society, hostility to economic development and to personal initiative, administrative incompetence, a culture of violence, and difficulties to establish a workable democracy, Africa does not seem ready to cope with the challenges of globalization and, for the foreseeable future, it will need to be treated with special care, particularly regarding trade. The United States of Africa project brings some hopes, as does its major brain child, the New Partnership for Africa's Development (NEPAD), wishfully a constructive way of engaging the forces of globalization and a road-map to the goal of African Renaissance, through a partnership between Africa and the developed world. This program is premised on African ownership, African control of projects and programs, with African leaders accepting that they will play their part in ending poverty, bringing about more peace, sustainable development, a stronger democracy, a human rights culture and less corruption. *b) Asia.* Because of a more relaxed view of its cultural identity, a regional civil consciousness would perhaps be easier in South-East Asia under the Association of South-East Asian Nations than it would be under the European Union. But the way in which neighboring powers in the region relate to each other poses a challenge to faster cooperation. *c) European Union.* Europe is creating a new political entity, a common culture, based on pre-rational elements, but also quite a few rational elements. Democracy may well prove very difficult to organize at the EU

level and it might be more and more ineffective as a linkage mechanism between public preferences and policy outputs at the national level.

2.9.3. Governance of globalization: the economy

2.9.3.1. Governance of international trade

Trade is the structural and long-term solution for the economic growth of developing countries. But important ethical concerns regarding the current international trade system need to be solved. 1) Asymmetric trade liberalization, with the South forced to reduce its tariffs and trade barriers and the North not fully reciprocating. 2) Agricultural subsidies have been provided in a way which actually harms developing countries. 3) Developed countries use non-tariff barriers in unfair ways which exclude the goods of developing countries. 4) In the Uruguay Round there were the service sectors (particularly financial) which represented the goods produced by DCs upon which attention was focused. 5) The intellectual property regime does not balance the interests of producers and users, particularly in the case of health, and it has also led to bio-piracy, where long-standing traditional products of developing countries have been patented by firms from the North. 6) While improved labor market mobility would do more for global economic efficiency than improved capitals mobility, attention has focused on the latter to the exclusion of the former. 7) Some trade agreements have attempted to restrict government's rights to enact legislation and regulations intended to improve the wellbeing of their citizens. 8) The international trading economy is in the anomalous condition of diminishing tariff protection while increasing use of non tariff trade-distorting measures, less transparent and more difficult to identify.

2.9.3.2. *Governance of international finances*

Financial globalization accelerated in the 1980s with the fast liberalization of international capital movements in many countries. After a series of severe financial crises in a number of emerging countries, we witness a widespread questioning of the vision which had led to expect from the earlier trend manifest and widely shared benefits. *a) Ethical issues in the globalization of finance and responsibilities and duties of international financial institutions (IFI).* The most developed countries and especially multilateral institutions have a duty to advise LDCs on what are prudent levels of debt, and on how to manage their risks, but they have not done so and have often provided advice which has exacerbated the risks for LDCs. *b) Countries' insolvency and bankruptcy regimes.* A very delicate question concerns the solution for those cases in which a country is perceived to be insolvent. The comparison with the legal treatment of insolvency of a firm makes ethical sense and it seems fair to institute a formal procedure for the solution of such cases. *c) Highly indebted countries.* In some cases, the degree of culpability of the lenders may be sufficiently great that the moral case for debt forgiveness seems compelling. There is one important reason however, against debt forgiveness, namely, that it encourages bad borrowing ('moral hazard'). Until an international authority is created, it is the moral duty of rich and powerful countries to act in ways designed to help the world's disadvantaged. The HIPC (Highly Indebted Poor Countries) and PRSP (Poverty Reduction Strategy Papers) initiatives and the recent debt and poverty reduction strategies of Bretton Woods institutions, are allowing significant progress in the countries which have already benefited from them. *d) Policies to confront crises.* In emerging countries crises have meant much disarray and misery. Their recurrence shows that they have a systemic character, which calls for a reconsider-

ation of practices and policies applied during the last decade. *e) The global reserve system.* An outsider looking at the global financial system would note one peculiarity: the richest country in the world seems to find it impossible to live within its means, borrowing in 2006 some \$850 billion a year (6.5% of its GDP) from abroad – including almost half from emerging countries. Part of the problem lies with the global reserve system, which entails countries putting aside money for emergencies. The ‘reserves’ are typically held in hard currencies, particularly in dollars, and this implies that poor countries lend to the United States substantial sums every year. The instabilities and inequities associated with the global reserve system can impose high costs on the poor. *f) Financing of the public sector* that is unconnected to controllable productive projects is especially worthy of consideration. This is because of the onerous conditions often attached to such lending, where ‘onerous conditions’ means those that are more stringent than normal market conditions and that, accumulated over time, end up constituting an unbearable burden on the borrowing countries. Believing that all governments are committed to the common good of the people, that is, the well-being of each and every one of a country’s inhabitants, is an expression of naivety that must be punished in cases where the government is controlled by bloody dictators that subject society to their will, denying its natural inalienable rights, governing for the enrichment of themselves, their families and those close to them who helped them to remain in power. *g) Recent points of progress.* i) The further development and restructuring of some activities of the IMF and World Bank; ii) the establishment of the Financial Stability Forum in Basel; iii) the supplementing of the ongoing cooperation between the G-10 countries by the new G-20 grouping; iv) the intermediate evolution of many codes and standards for the financial markets and for the supervision of financial systems; v) the adoption of

new anti-crises facilities in the IMF. *b) Renewed challenges.* As it was mentioned in 1.2.2.2, recent developments in international finance with the introduction of ever changing and ever more sophisticated financial instruments have resulted in the current, dangerous crisis originated in the so-called sub-prime mortgages market. It is clear that new financial technologies also need new forms of supervision and regulatory norms, both at the national and at the global levels, i.e., new forms of world financial governance. In its absence, the whole promising process of economic development at the world level, and particularly in emerging and least developed countries, will be permanently at risk.

2.9.3.3. *Insufficient aid to developing countries*

It is a scandal that a promise made thirty years ago, i.e., aid equal to 0.7% of GNI has not been fulfilled yet. Given the failures of the past and its natural weakness at the time of discussing national budgets, *earmarking of resources* is the most secure way to ensure adequate aid financing. Taxes levied at a very low rate on internationally mobile tax bases would be less distortionary than additions to existing national taxes. Taxation on resources risking depletion, like fisheries or the global climate, are natural candidates since they will also help to preserve the natural environment of mankind. The same can be said of the space in space needed to launch satellites. Other alternatives could be taxing goods consumed by high income groups – such as international flights – and resources eventually originated in the reform of the global reserve system. Although altruism seems to be on the rise, adjustment pressures of traditional economic and social structures emerging from globalization are not conducive to helping people and countries often perceived as competitors. It is vital to find practical ways to overcome this situation. Education, health, credit, access of the poor to property, entrepreneurial

abilities and facilities to increase LDCs' exports are the most secure ways of investing aid resources aid in order to minimize the risks of ineffectiveness.

2.10. *The environment*

To meet this challenge an interdisciplinary approach is required. The poorest countries are likely to pay the heaviest price for ecological deterioration (HH Benedict XVI, *PASS*, 2007).

2.10.1. *The anthropocene and a worldwide strategy*

Considering the whole and still growing impacts of human activities on the earth and the atmosphere, and at all scales, including global ones, it is appropriate to focus on the role of mankind in geology and ecology by using the term *anthropocene* for the current geological epoch. Developing a worldwide accepted strategy leading to ecosystem sustainability against human-induced stresses will be one of the great future tasks of mankind, requiring intensive research efforts and wise application of knowledge. There are plenty of opportunities for energy savings, solar voltaic and maybe fusion energy production, materials' recycling, soil conservation, more efficient agricultural production, etc. Exciting, but also difficult and daunting tasks lie ahead of the global research and engineering community to guide mankind towards global, sustainable, environmental management into the *anthropocene*.

2.10.2. *Exhausting of fuels, pollution and global warming*

In the space of a few generations mankind is exhausting the fossil fuels that were generated over several hundred million years, resulting in large emissions of air pollutants. Human activ-

ity has also increased the species extinction rate by a thousand to ten thousand fold in the tropical rain forests. According to the 2007 Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change, 'warming of the climate system is unequivocal, as is now evident from observations of increases in global average air and ocean temperatures, widespread melting of snow and ice, and rising sea level'.

2.10.3. *Water*

Water as a problem is the result of poverty. The situation of inequity in terms of access variability to safe drinking water is reported as follows. A child born in the developed world consumes 30 to 50 times the water resources of one in the developing world. Little effective progress has resulted since the publication of *World Water Vision* (World Water Forum, The Hague, 2000). A successful answer to these challenges requires a sense of a global community with shared values or principles and a sense of justice as moral approbation oriented towards the environment, based on the respect for the Creation. Negative rights are inviolable, in a way that positive rights are not. For how can a right be inviolable if it is not always possible to protect it? The combination of the biological and geo-physical aspects of water have had far-reaching influences on our attitude toward water and the property-rights systems communities have devised for it. A good water policy would be to either charge farmers that rent or to impose quotas on extraction rates on individual farmers. A third, and better, alternative would be to set a quota on the aggregate rate of extraction, issue farmers with licenses to extract and allow them to trade licenses among one another if they so wish. If the water table in the aquifer is both high and deep, the rent component would be expected to be small relative to production costs; meaning that its stock is unlimited. The correct measure of 'water scarcity' is its social rent. It would be

interesting if international organizations, such as the FAO, were to try to estimate the time trend of water rents in regions that are now facing water stress. Until water is seen as an economic good, its procurement and use will continue to be inefficient and, ultimately, unjust.

2.10.4. *Global warming, water and agriculture in poor regions*

Agricultural production in tropical zones is more likely to be affected by global warming. With the right incentives and investments to mitigate risks for individual farmers, improving water control in agriculture holds considerable potential to increase food production and reduce poverty, while ensuring the maintaining of ecosystem services. The potential exists to provide adequate and sustainable supply of quality water for all, today and in the future. But there is no room for complacency, and it is our common responsibility to take the challenge of today's global water crisis and address it in all of its aspects and dimensions.

2.11. *Proposals made by the participants*³⁸

2.11.1. *General approaches*

There is an incipient mutual acknowledgment between critics and defenders of globalization on the necessity of negotiating jointly the terms of 'another globalization'. The only true alternative seems to be not to de-globalize, but to build a different

³⁸ In spite of the fact that the Pontifical Academy of Social Sciences gathers mainly theoretical and empirically based sciences, most of them neither applied nor practical, an important number of their members and contributors to the plenary sessions and workshops have suggested relevant proposals whose summary follows.

globalization, clearly in line with what HH John Paul II insistently claimed. In the meantime, the increasingly widespread discontent with globalization is a real threat not only to the economy, but also to the evidently fragile world peace.

2.11.2. *Poverty reduction and alleviation*

Some of the proposals suggested are the following. a) Increasing the benefits from trade and capital flows through the combination of institutions responsive to the market but controlled by the state; fair land reform; implementation of labor-intensive technologies and an active industrial policy to introduce the country in new niches in the world market). b) Overcoming the resource squeeze, increasing the fiscal autonomy of the state through a new approach to macroeconomic policy and people-centered budget initiatives. c) Generating pro-poor growth by restoring full employment; reorienting social spending, especially towards education, universal accesses and social safety nets; promoting micro-enterprises and the informal sector; increasing the productivity of small-scale agriculture; providing the poor with means to save, to have access to credit and start small businesses; promoting micro-finance schemes as an efficient way to empower the poor and increase their ability to save and invest and, finally, taking measures to help poor people start new businesses. d) Fulfilling poverty reduction targets and programs, like the Millennium Goals. e) Reducing human insecurities of any kind. f) Addressing the need for greater equity in the international system. g) On the LDC institutional front, strengthening governing institutions; updating public and private sector management and leadership; civil service reform; better economic, financial and urban management; supporting decentralization and local governance, empowering people and civil society organizations – the wellspring of social capital.

2.11.3. *Reducing the gaps*

a) *Economic volatility, the international public good and international frameworks and institutions.* To avoid increased volatility in the world economy, we need better multilateral agreements and institutions, designed with more participation of developing countries but avoiding the risk of free riding and moral hazard.

b) *Foreign Aid.* The Tobin tax could be a valuable tool if the adequate formula were found. The alternative, proper globalization should include clear signals of revitalization and modernization of foreign aid to development, reaching the target of 0.7% of GNI (Gross National Income) of DCs; a sincere new commercial policy of DCs; renewed initiatives regarding debt relief for highly indebted and really poor countries; a reconsideration of those policies related to education, science and R&D, including patents, for LDCs, and a reformulation of the approaches of international financial institutions regarding the institutional reform in LDCs.

2.11.4. *Education*

The crucial point in the continuity of development and in diminishing the gaps between poor and rich countries is the access to knowledge. Massive investment in human capital and access to education are urgent needs. This implies the creation of infrastructures in countries with below average GDP, including information technologies, education possibilities, lifelong education and other factors such as access to products of scientific and technological research. Additionally, universities in the 21st century must not close themselves into a strictly professional circle, in order to play a decisive role in the strengthening of democratic life.

2.11.5. *Migrations*

Although there are no easy answers to the immigration/integration dilemmas the matter is urgent and needs careful attention. It is essential that anti-immigrant propaganda and all elements which feed it should cease. The UNESCO as well as schools, universities and churches must promote multi-cultural exchanges, cultural feasts aimed at multi-culturality and peace in this globalization context. There is a pressing need to reinforce the view of immigrants as a development resource. There is also an ethical obligation on the part of former colonial host countries to prepare themselves appropriately for the post-colonial, 'compensatory phase', without neglecting the importance of remittances, that are double the size of aid and at least as well targeted to the poor. The world economy is paying a price in terms of economic growth because of the necessity to establish higher interest rates than the ones that will be needed with more international migrations and looser labor markets.

2.11.6. *Aid and a new world social contract*

a) *Aid at the world level.* It is possible to figure out a new 'Social Contract of Globalization', actively promoted by the UN. Countries with above-average per capita GDP would give regularly, in set amounts, appropriations to those countries that fall below this index and that fulfill necessary conditions for the granting of these resources, like no repression of private initiative and promotion of public goods such as education, health care, and the rule of law. Financial resources should not be passed to state organs of relevant countries but to an institution commissioned by the UN for realizing the 'Social Contract of Globalization'. b) *Internal social contract.* In a knowledge socie-

ty, in which intellectual capital plays the main role in wealth creation, it seems necessary to tie company ownership to the person who is the owner of such capital in the form of a wider capital participation of citizens as an alternative source of their income. Experience and research suggest that companies in which the stakeholders participate both in management and in profit and capital are most efficient.

2.11.7. *Empowerment*

One of the social outcomes of an economic policy should be the self-empowerment of monetarily poor people who, when empowered and socially enlightened, can even propel governance at all levels. The universal destination of the goods of Creation must be translated into fair agrarian reform, the welcoming of immigrants, participative democracy, the self-organization of economic and financial activities at the local level and the cooperation of diverse religions and ethnic groups.

2.11.8. *The role of religions and civil society*

There is a need for 'civil society' advocacy groups to ensure that trans-national corporations or governments do respect the rights and needs of poorer countries and the poor. Movements such as Jubilee 2000 for Debt Relief and inter-religious networks for providing housing for the poor in Asia are just some examples of what they can do. While religions are generally concerned with the poor, a case has been made to show that fundamentalism and structural ideologies like castes can vitiate the input that religions can bring. It is against this background that the importance of initiating an inter-religious dialogue in action-oriented poverty research seems to be essential.

2.11.9. *Global warming*

Almost ninety percent of the carbon emissions that pollute our planet come from developed countries but these emissions have a negative impact all around the world. The sincere commitment of all countries to the Kyoto Protocol and to other measures to protect the environment is necessary.

2.11.10. *International trade*

a) Barriers to knowledge access. It is of course necessary to R&D efforts to have a prudential property right protection in the case of intellectual goods and services. But the way in which these rights are enforced in the real world allows the emergence of different kinds of monopoly, with negative consequences not only on economic development but also, as regards health issues, on the life expectancy of millions of people, particularly in developing countries. A new international framework for a non-monopolist protection of intellectual property rights is needed. *b) Trade liberalization and poverty.* Trade liberalization has set the adequate conditions for a more rapid growth through a better access to knowledge, goods, services, technologies and capital. But trade liberalization in a protectionist world context could be damaging, particularly for the countries that produce agricultural goods. Regarding the bad, although transitory consequences of trade liberalization, governments should adopt compensatory policies, guaranteeing a minimal income to those affected by foreign competition. At the same time, they should develop adequate infrastructures, improve the market for credit and give flexibility to the labor market. The WTO's role is crucial for a just and fair deepening of trade liberalization. Additionally, given the fact that the expansion of international trade in market commodities can place a negative pressure on those goods and serv-

ices that are unpriced, like those that come from nature, when international agencies espouse trade expansion, they should simultaneously urge domestic governments to take note of the recommended expansion's effects on nature. *c) Agricultural protectionism and subsidies.* Because of agricultural protectionism and subsidies, which amount to the incredible figure of 400 billion USD per year in the OECD countries, millions of farmers and food producers of LDCs cannot have access to developed countries' markets. This is completely against fairness in international trade, since a lot of LDCs are not allowed to play the games in which they are the best. This also has a very negative effect on drug production and trafficking, because when farmers of the poor countries have their markets for legal products closed, they will more probably use their land for drug crops. *d) Regional economic associations.* It seems clear that regional economic associations, not closed to international trade, can be a good device for better domesticating the forces of globalization, at least in the transition to the freer trade world that, we hope, will result from the continuity of Doha's WTO round. *e) Subsidies in the case of developing countries.* In a free market economy subsidies must be forbidden. But the justice rule involves applying equal treatment to equal conditions and, consequently, different treatment to unequal conditions. It is critical to take this into account in international negotiations of any kind.

2.11.11. *International finances*

a) International financial institutions. There is now a need for a third wave of regulatory agencies controlling the unregulated but immensely powerful global finance markets. Ethics certainly recommends a new balance in the statutes of the IMF and the WB as well as in other initiatives like the Financial Stability Forum, giving more representation to LDCs. *b) International*

financial regulations. It is essential to develop a clear vision of an appropriate financial architecture in the new circumstances, including: obtaining through international cooperation appropriate transparency and regulation of international financial loans and capital markets; provision of sufficient international official liquidity in distress conditions; orderly debt workout procedures at the international level; international measures both for crisis prevention and management; mechanisms to give or allow appropriate liquidity and development finance for low income countries, and to regulate excessive surges of potentially reversible capital flows in recipient countries, without discouraging them excessively. The appropriate way to overcome crises in emerging markets is not to scale down the role of the IMF. According to its critics, it would blindly follow preconceived principles, labeled as ideological by the protesters: full freedom of capital transactions and the balance of public budgets, without enough consideration to prerequisites about the development of the national financial system or the surrounding business trends. These criticisms are worth considering. *c) National policies and regulations.* Better policies are needed to make more difficult the development of bubbles on the financial markets as well as to improve transparency both in the private and in the public sectors. *d) Developing countries' crises.* Regarding crises, increased caution is required from national authorities, particularly regarding exchange rate management, macroeconomic regulation and the surveillance of the financial system. *e) Aid, foreign direct investment and debt relief.* Public and private aid via transfer of capital and the help of individuals or groups is in most cases necessary and the Church should encourage such help. But this is not enough. Aid-receiving countries themselves must also create the conditions for attracting private capital from outside (FDI, foreign direct investment), that can also play an important role in economic devel-

opment. The same has to be said for debt forgiveness. Even the HIPC-Initiative of the IMF and World Bank can only contribute to more and lasting wealth for the people if the freed resources are used in a way that is really productive. Debt relief is clearly not a panacea. Further progress should now result from the active implementation of the Monterrey consensus, which aims at replacing with a partnership what has so far been a frequently frustrating assistance relationship between industrialised and developing countries. *f) Global reserve system.* There are reforms that would address the global reserve system's problems, eventually including an annual emission of SDR ('global greenbacks'), which could be used to finance development and other global public goods.

2.12. References

- Allot, Phillip (2007). *Five Steps to a New World Order*, Seegers Lecture 2007: Valparaiso University School of Law, Chile.
- Bhagwati, Jagdish (2004). *In Defense of Globalization*, Oxford University Press.
- Boldrin, Michele and David K. Levine (2006). *Growth and Intellectual Property*, National Bureau of Economic Research, NBER Working Paper 12769.
- Castells, Manuel and Martin Ince (2003). *Conversations with Manuel Castells*, Cambridge: Polity Press-Oxford: Blackwell.
- Dasgupta, Partha (2002), 'Sustainable Development: Past Hopes and Present Realizations among the World's Poor', The Pontifical Academy of Social Sciences, Eighth Plenary Session, Vatican City.
- Davies, James B., Susanna Sandstrom, Anthony Shorrocks and Edward N. Wolff (2006). *The World Distribution of Household Wealth*, World Institute for Development Economic Research of the United Nations University (WIDER).
- Friedman, Tom (2006). *The World is Flat: A Brief History of the Twenty-first Century*, New York: Farrar, Strauss and Giroux.
- Fukuyama, Francis (2004). *State-Building: Governance and World Order in the 21st Century*, Cornell University Press.
- Her Majesty's Treasury (2007). *Stern Review on the Economics of Climate Change*, London.
- Huntington, Samuel P. (2005). *Who Are We? The Challenges to America's National Identity*. New York: Simon & Schuster.
- (2006). *Political Order in Changing Societies*. Yale University Press.
- Llach, Juan J. (2005) *The Challenge of International Educational Gaps in the Context of Globalizations*, Joint Working Group of the Pontifical Academies of Sciences and Social Sciences on Globalization and Education.

- Nissanke, Machiko and Erik Thorbecke (2007). *The Impact of Globalization on the World's Poor*, Palgrave-Macmillan.
- Pontifical Academy of Sciences (2005). Working Group on *Water and the Environment*, Vatican City.
- Pontifical Academy of Sciences and Pontifical Academy of Social Sciences, *Education and Globalization* (2005). Proceedings of the Joint Working Group of those Academies, Berlin and New York: Walter de Gruyter.
- Ratzinger, Joseph, Pope Benedict XVI (2007). *Jesus of Nazareth. From the Baptism in the Jordan to the Transfiguration*, Doubleday.
- Rodrik, Dani (2003, editor). *In Search of Prosperity. Analytical Narratives of Economic Growth*, Princeton University Press.
- (2006). 'Goodbye Washington Consensus, Hello Washington Confusion? A Review of the World Bank's *Economic Growth in the 1990's: Learning from a Decade of Reform*', *Journal of Economic Literature*: XLIV, December (973-987)
- Sachs, Jeffrey (2005). *The End of Poverty. Economic Possibilities of Our Time*. New York: The Penguin Press.
- Sala i Martin, Xavier (2006). 'The World Distribution of Income: Falling Poverty and...Convergence, Period', *Quarterly Journal of Economics*, CXXI, 2, May (351-397).
- Stiglitz, Joseph (2006). *Making Globalization Work. The Next Steps to Global Justice*, Penguin-Allen Lane.
- UNEP United Nations Environment Program and WMO (World Meteorological Association): Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change (2007). *Climate Change 2007: The Physical Science Basis. Summary for Policy Makers*, Paris Conference.
- UNESCO (no date), *The Return of the Restitution of Cultural Property*, Paris.
- (2005). *Knowledge Societies*, Paris.
- United Nations Climate Change Conference (2006). Various reports, Nairobi.

APPENDIX I

Guidelines for the future of globalization

Then the King will say to those on his right, 'Come, you who are blessed by my Father, inherit the kingdom prepared for you from the foundation of the world; for I was hungry, and you gave me food; I was thirsty, and you gave me drink; a stranger, and you took me in; naked, and you clothed me; I was sick, and you cared for me; in prison, and you visited me'. Then the righteous will answer him, saying, 'Lord, when did we see you hungry, and feed you; or thirsty, and give you a drink? When did we see you as a stranger, and take you in; or naked, and clothe you? When did we see you sick, or in prison, and visit you?' The King will answer them, 'Most assuredly I tell you, whatever you did for one of these least brothers of mine, you did to me'.

(Matthew, 25:34-40)

'Charity helps justice to be more inventive'.

(HH Benedict XVI, *Letter to the President of the Pontifical Academy of Social Sciences*, April 30, 2007)

The globalized world we live in has too much poverty, too many walls, too many weapons and wars and a lack of respect for the Creation. We need to build a world without (extreme) poverty, with more respect for the Creation, more peace, fewer weapons and plenty of dialogue to build a civilization of love based on the

principle of the universal destination of all the goods of the Creation. Confronted with such unprecedented challenges, discussions normally held on policies to mend some of the sources of injustice and lack of charity proliferating all around the world sound almost pathetic. Yes, they can help solve specific questions here and there, some of them relevant to improving the lives of many people. However, giving proper answers to these challenges seems to be something completely different. The process of domestication of a civilization-wide change to improve the effectiveness of charity and justice might only be dealt with sounder, cultural answers. They must be centered in concrete gestures of cultural change, as unprecedented as the change we confront.

We can envisage different issues to be addressed by countries and world institutions.

Developed countries should promote or implement renewed projects like the following, not least to rebuild their damaged moral authority.

- *Eradicating extreme poverty* by the year 2015 is one of the most important tasks in today's world and that objective is indissolubly linked to world peace and security.
- Fulfilling the so many times promised *level of aid* (0.7% of GNI, Gross National Income), finding innovative ways of financing it through the earmarking of resources coming from reducing agricultural subsidies or in the taxation on international public good or exhaustible resources.
- Improving the ways of *delivering that aid* through creative and effective projects based on the active participation of people in the recipient countries.
- Creating *trade conditions* favorable to poor countries, including broad and unconditional access to DCs' markets.
- Unconditionally cancelling the *external debt of HIPC*s (Highly Indebted Poor Countries) and LDCs and implementing measures to ensure that they do not fall once again in similar situations.

- Substantially increasing *investments in R&D of medicines* to treat AIDS, tuberculosis, malaria and other tropical diseases, making available medical and drugs technologies without imposing legal or economic conditions.
- Sincerely *re-thinking the global reserves system*.
- Substantially reducing both legal and illegal *arms trade, illegal trade of precious raw materials, capital flights from LDCs and money-laundering*.
- Decisively promoting *peace in the Middle East*.
- Supporting projects to *return or restore the artistic treasures that were originally of LDCs*, considering the possibility of a Trust-Fund whose income could help finance foreign aid³⁹.

Emerging countries

- Emerging countries with higher levels of GDP per capita (for instance, more than 10,000 US\$ in purchasing power parity) *are in a condition to contribute to the aid for the eradication of poverty* through a progressive contribution, beginning with 0.1% of GNI.
- *Focusing foreign aid on the poorest countries* and on special programs to fight against poverty in LDCs.
- *Co-leading financial coordination* to prevent a dangerous outcome of world financial imbalances and instabilities

Developing countries

- Committing to sincere *internal and external peace processes* – including the very crucial ones of the Middle East.

³⁹ See UNESCO (no date), *The Return or the Restitution of Cultural Property* (www.unesco.org).

- *Improving substantially the quality of democratic governance.*
- *Giving true priority to the poor in government programs.*

International institutions

- *Developing a legitimate pluralistic vision, not one just based on the opinion of a few, which also ends up discriminating cultural diversity and intermediate bodies, and ignoring the principle of subsidiarity.*

All countries and global institutions

- *Actively promoting dialogue, the development of common norms, the building of international cooperation based on the principle of universality but also on shared values and the enhancing and strengthening of the international institutions that implement these shared norms and values.*
- *Regarding the projects financed through foreign aid resources it seems prudent to give priority to those that can lead to the empowerment of the poor, as it is the case with education, health, credit, access to property, entrepreneurial abilities and facilities to increase LDCs' exports.*
- *In spite of the fact that the Millennium Goals are not going to be fully accomplished in 2015, perhaps it is already time to think about the next round of Millennium Goals. The ones we have fall very short of an integral conception of human development, beginning with the surprising exclusion of the family and the rights of the unborn.*
- *Sustained improvement of the enrolment rates and of the quality of education, particularly in the socially segregated schools that the poor attend.*
- *Credible commitments to a socially protected free trade through the fulfilment of the Doha Round in its original, but renewed spirit of development round.*

-
- *Foreign Direct Investment (FDI)* has a crucial role as a source of financing and incorporating human capital and technologies in developing countries. It also has another important and increasing role, i.e., the development of a paradigm of social responsibility of the firms, to which all countries could contribute as a way of enhancing the positive role of FDI, as well as of avoiding its often conflictive aspects.
 - *Equally renewed commitment to the non proliferation of nuclear and non-nuclear arms and to an equitable disarmament.*
 - *Credible and enforceable commitments to the Kyoto Protocol or similar international arrangements to protect the Creation.*

Finally, it is evident that, confronted with such cultural, economic, social and political context, the role of religions, and of course of the Catholic Church, is ever more crucial to convince global powers, international organizations and governments of emerging and poor countries of the necessity of a completely new vision to confront the unprecedented changes we are experiencing. The difficulty of reaching such a vision without a parallel consensus on the nature of human beings makes this challenge even more demanding but must not be an excuse to abandon this crucial endeavour.

APPENDIX II

Programs of the Sessions and Workshops of the Pontifical Academy of Social Sciences on Different Dimensions of Globalization

1. *IV Plenary Session: Democracy: Some Acute Questions. Sessions devoted to 'Supranationality, internationality and democracy' (1998)*

- S. Bartolini: 'European Integration and Democracy: Some Skeptical Reflections (Europe: its international and its governmental structures and their relation to democracy)'.
- *Discussion*
- T.A. Mensah: 'International and Governmental Structures and their Relation to Democracy: Common Report on Africa, America and Asia'.
- *Discussion*
- L. Sabourin: 'La mondialisation en quête de gouvernance démocratique: contradictions nationales, contraintes internationales'.
- *Discussion*
- T. de Montbrial: 'Interventions internationales, souveraineté des Etats et démocratie'.
- *Discussion*
- *General debate*

2. *Workshop: The Social Dimensions of Globalization (2000)*

- L. Sabourin: 'Dimensions et portée de la mondialisation et de la globalisation'.

-
- D. Goulet: ‘The Evolving Nature of Development in the Light of Globalization’.
 - H. Bjorkman: ‘The Message of the 1999 Human Development Report – Globalization with a Human Face’.
 - S. Bernal Restrepo: ‘The Social and Cultural Dimensions of Globalization’.
 - S. Zamagni: ‘Globalization and Local Particularities. Globalization Processes and Transnational Civil Society between Universality and Particularism’.
 - D. Martin: ‘Globalization in the Social Teaching of the Church’.

3. VII Plenary Session. *Globalization: Ethical and Institutional Concerns* (2001)

- *Preface* (L. Sabourin)
 - *Address of the President to the Holy Father*
 - *Address of the Holy Father, HH John Paul II, to the Participants of the Seventh Plenary Session*
 - *Report by the President*
 - *Scientific Papers:*
 - J. Schasching: ‘The Church’s View on Globalization’.
- First Session: Globalization and Human Development: Ethical Approaches*
- J. Zubrzycki: ‘Introductory Statement by the Committee for Relations with Developing Countries’.
 - D.A. Crocker: ‘Globalization and Human Development: Ethical Approaches’.
 - *Comments:*
 - R. Rémond
 - W.V. Villacorta: ‘Globalization and Disparities in South-east Asia’.

– S.B. Restrepo. ‘An Ethical Assessment of Globalization’.
Second Session: The Global Economy: Emerging Forms of (Inter) Dependence

– P.H. Dembinski: ‘The New Global Economy: Emerging Forms of (Inter) Dependence’.

– *Comments:*

– P.S. Dasgupta: ‘Globalization and Non-Market Relationships’.

– T. Nojiri

– S. Zamagni: ‘Globalization and the New Migratory Question’.

Third Session: The Impact of Globalization on Poverty/Cultural Identities

– Z. Diabrè: ‘Globalization and Poverty: Potentials and Challenges’.

– P. Morandé Court: ‘The Impact of ‘Globalization’ on Cultural Identities’.

– *Comments:*

– M.M. Ramirez

– P.L. Zampetti: ‘La famiglia, la cultura delle comunità locali e il processo di globalizzazione’.

– M.S. Archer: ‘The Impact of Globalization on Cultural Identities. A Comment on Pedro Morandé’s Paper’.

Fourth Session: Globalization and Institutional Change: A Development Perspective

– J. Braga de Macedo: ‘Globalization and Institutional Change: A Development Perspective’.

– *Comments:*

– H. Suchocka

– J.J. Llach: ‘Globalization and Governance: the Flip Side of the Coin’.

– P.M. Zulu

Fifth Session: The Impact of Global Financial Flows on Developing Countries

- S. Griffith-Jones: ‘Developing Countries and the New Financial Architecture’.
- *Comments:*
- K.J. Arrow
- H. Tietmeyer: ‘Ways to Improve the Functioning of Financial Markets’.

Sixth Session: Globalization and the Church’s New Challenges

- J. Homeyer: ‘Europa und die Globalisierung – Der Beitrag der Kirche’.
- *Comments:*
- M.A. Glendon: ‘Meeting the Challenges of Globalization’
- G. Tognon: ‘An Educational Strategy for a Christian Culture of Globalization’.

Other papers presented by academicians

- M. Schooyans: ‘L’ONU et la Globalisation’.
- B.B. Vymětalík: ‘About the Possibilities of Reducing Poverty in a Global World’.

Concluding Session

- R. Minnerath: ‘La globalisation et l’éthique ou l’éthique de la globalisation?’
- M.M. Ramirez: ‘Globalization and the Common Humanity: Ethical and Institutional Concerns’.

4. *Colloquium. Globalization and inequalities (2002)*

- Introduction (L. Sabourin)
- *Scientific papers*

Part I: Inequalities in the Light of Globalization

- D. Goulet: ‘Inequalities in the Light of Globalization’.

Comment:

- B. Betancur: ‘La Subversión de la Pobreza’.

Part II: Globalization and International Inequalities: Changing North-South Relations

- J.J. Llach: ‘Gaps and Poverty in the Long Run’.
- *Comments:*
- J. Zubrzycki: ‘Population Pressure and Refugees in an Era of Global Apartheid’.
- H. Suchocka
- P. Kirchhof

Part III: The Impact of International Finance and Trade on Inequalities

- M. Camdessus: ‘Prêts internationaux, finance internationale, réduction de la pauvreté et des inégalités’.
- A. Ouedraogo: ‘Mondialisation et Inégalités’.
- *Comments:*
- P.S. Dasgupta
- B.B. Vymětalík: ‘A Note on the Possibilities of Helping Developing Countries’.
- J.T. Raga Gil

Part IV: Globalisation, Religion and Poverty

- A. Riccardi: ‘Mondialisation, religions et pauvreté’.
- S. D’souza: ‘Globalization, Religion and Poverty (Focus on Asia)’.
- R.B. Goudjo: ‘Mondialisation, religions et pauvreté’.
- R. Papini: ‘Mondialisation et pauvreté dans le magistère social de l’Église’.
- J.M. Fardeau: ‘Colloque sur la mondialisation et les inégalités’.
- *Comments:*
- M.M. Ramirez
- P.L. Zampetti
- P. Kirchhof

5. IX Plenary Session. *The Governance of Globalization (2003)*

- *Preface* (L. Sabourin)
- *Address of the President to the Holy Father*
- *Address of the Holy Father to the Participants of the Ninth Plenary Session*
- *Report by the President*
- *Scientific Papers*

First Session: The Governance of Globalization: Political Perspectives

- R.R. Martino: ‘La Chiesa e la Globalizzazione’.
- L. Sabourin: ‘La recherche d’une nouvelle gouvernance de la mondialisation sous le prisme du conflit irakien: pause temporaire ou retour à Babel?’.

Second Session: The Governance of Globalization: Legal Perspectives

- J.H.H. Weiler: ‘Governance without Government: The Normative Challenge to the Global Legal Order’.
- *Comments:*
- N. McNally: ‘A View from Africa’.
- P.G. Carozza: ‘Demos, Nomos and Globalization’.
- P. Kirchhof: ‘Subsidiarität und Souveränität in Zeiten der Globalisierung’.
- *Comments:*
- H. Schambeck: ‘Subsidiarität und Souveränität in Zeiten der Globalisierung’.
- K. Skubiszewski: ‘Use of Force in International Relations after 11 September 2001’.

Third Session: The Governance of Globalization: Sociological Perspectives

- M.S. Archer: ‘Social Integration, System Integration and Global Governance’.
- *Comments:*
- S. Averintsev

- P.P. Donati: ‘Globalization and Governance’.
- J. Bindé: ‘Vers des sociétés du savoir?’
- *Comments:*
- H. Zacher: ‘Globalisierung, Governance und Wissen; ein Kommentar’.
- M. Schooyans: ‘Savoir et mobilité sociale’.
- R. Rémond

Fourth Session. The Governance of Globalization: Ethical and Philosophical Perspectives

- R. Minnerath: ‘Une autorité mondiale – point de vue de l’Église catholique’.
- *Comments:*
- V. Possenti
- G.P. Crepaldi: ‘Contributo’.
- P.L. Zampetti: ‘Una autorità mondiale’.
- D. Joly: ‘The Governance of Immigration and Integration’.
- *Comments:*
- P. Zulu: ‘Response’.
- M.M. Ramirez: ‘A Comment’.

Fifth Session: The Governance of Globalization: World Perspectives

- J.E. Stiglitz: ‘Ethics, Market and Government Failure, and Globalization’.
- *Comments:*
- J.J. Llach: ‘Comments on two Papers of J. Stiglitz’.
- P.S. Dasgupta: ‘On the Paper of Professor Stiglitz’.
- H. Tietmeyer: ‘Ein Kommentar’.

Sixth Session: The Governance of Globalization: Economic Perspectives

- A. Winters: ‘Trade Liberalization, Economic Growth and Poverty’.
- *Comments:*
- P.S. Dasgupta: ‘On the Paper of Professor Winters’.
- J.J. Llach: ‘Comment’.

- J.T. Raga Gil: ‘Free Market and Protectionism in a Global Scenario with Inequality’.
- E. Malinvaud: ‘Vers quelques principes éthiques pour la gouvernance de la mondialisation financière’.
- *Comments:*
- J.T. Raga Gil: ‘Some Considerations Concerning Ethics in Financial Globalization’.
- B.B. Vymětalík: ‘Globalization May Serve the Man’.
- H. Tietmeyer: ‘Toward a Few Ethical Principles for the Governance of Financial Globalization’.

6. *Joint Working Group of the Pontifical Academy of Social Sciences and the Pontifical Academy of Sciences*

- Edmond Malinvaud and Pierre Léna. Word of Welcome.
- First Session: New Approaches to Education in the Globalized World*
- Howard Gardner: ‘The Synthesizing of Knowledge: An Imperative in a Global Society’.
 - Nicholas Negroponte: ‘The \$100 Laptop’.
 - M. Govind Kumar Menon: ‘Globalization and Education: An Overview’.
 - General Discussion chaired by Yves Quéré
- Second Session: The Role of Communication and Information Technologies*
- Michel Serres: ‘The Grand Narrative Told by the Sciences’.
 - Mortimer Zuckerman: ‘News, Global Communication Technologies and Education’.
 - Rajendra S. Pawar: ‘No One Left Behind’.
 - General Discussion chaired by Antonio Battro.
- Third Session: The Effects of Globalization on Education*
- David E. Bloom: ‘Education and Global Development’.

- Mohamed H.A. Hassan: ‘Promoting South-South and North-South Cooperation in Education and Research’.

- General Discussion chaired by Kevin Ryan

Fourth Session: Education of the Immigrants and their Children

- Marcelo Suárez Orozco: ‘Moving Stories: The Education of Immigrant and Refugee Children and Youth’.

- Louis-André Vallet: ‘What Can We Do to Improve the Education of Children from Disadvantaged Backgrounds?’

- General Discussion chaired by Margaret Archer

Fifth Session: Education and Cultural Diversity

- Wei-Yu: ‘Globalization and Cultural Identity’.

- Jean-Claude Berthélemy: ‘Globalization and Challenges for Education in Least Developed Countries’.

- Mina M. Ramirez: ‘Cultural Diversity’.

- Juan José Llach: ‘Global Education Gaps: Recent Trends, Obstacles and Policies’.

- General Discussion chaired by Mary Ann Glendon

Sixth Session: Which Anthropological Basis for Education and Research?

- Jean-Didier Vincent: ‘What is Our Bioanthropological Knowledge of the Human Being?’

- Jürgen Mittelstrass: ‘Education between Ethical Universality and Cultural Particularity’.

- General Discussion chaired by Nicola Cabibbo

7. XIII Plenary Session. Charity and Justice in the Relations among Peoples and Nations (2007)

First Session

- H.E. Msgr. Paul Josef Cordes

- Father Joseph A. Di Noia OP: ‘Charity and Justice in the Relations among Peoples and Nations: the Encyclical *Deus Caritas Est* of Pope Benedict XVI’.

– *Comments:*

- H.E. Msgr. Roland Minnerath
- Prof. Herbert Schambeck

Second Session

- Prof. Philip Allott: ‘International Society and the Idea of Justice’.

– *Comments:*

- Prof. Hans Zacher
- H.E. Msgr. Marcelo Sánchez Sorondo

Third Session

- Prof. Giorgio Vittadini: ‘International Justice and the Role of Charities and Civil Society, with Special Reference to the Role of the Catholic Church’.

– *Comments:*

- Prof. Margaret Archer
- Prof. Mina M. Ramirez

Fourth Session

- H.E. Prof. Luis Ernesto Derbez Bautista: ‘Fairness in International Investments and Financing’.

– *Comments:*

- Prof. Hans Tietmeyer
- Prof. José T. Raga
- Prof. François Perigot

Fifth Session

- Round Table: *International Justice and Aid. Do We Need some Scheme of Redistribution of Income at the World Level Along the Lines of What Most Countries Have at the National Level?*

- Dr. Jean-Pierre Landau
- Former President Prof. Edmond Malinvaud
- Prof. Joseph Stiglitz

Sixth Session

- Dr. Henry Kissinger: ‘Current International Trends and World Peace’.

– *Comments:*

- Dr. José Miguel Insulza
- Former President Prof. Belisario Betancur

Seventh Session

- Dr. José Miguel Insulza: ‘International Justice, International Law and World Peace’.

– *Comments:*

- Prof. Vittorio Possenti
- Prof. Krzysztof Skubiszewski

Eighth Session

- Round Table: *Inter-religious Dialogue and World Peace.*
- H.Em. Walter Card. Kasper
- Rabbi David Rosen
- H.Em. Pierre Card. Sfeir Nasrallah
- H.E. Msgr. Antonios Naguib

Ninth Session

- H.Em. Tarcisio Card. Bertone: ‘International Justice and International Governance in the Context of the Crisis of Multilateralism’.

– *Comments:*

- President Prof. Mary Ann Glendon

Tenth Session

- Dr. Jacques Diouf: ‘International Justice, Water and Respect for the Creation’.

– *Comments:*

- Prof. Partha Dasgupta
- Prof. Hsin-chi Kuan

Eleventh Session

- Prof. Marcelo Suárez-Orozco: ‘International Migrations and the Access of Immigrants and Their Families to a Decent Standard of Living and to the Public Goods’.

– *Comments:*

- Prof. Pierpaolo Donati

-
- Prof. Rocco Buttiglione
 - Prof. Maurizio Ambrosini

Twelfth Session

- Round Table: *International Justice and Poverty. Are the Millennium Goals Enough to Free the Poorest from Poverty? The Millennium Goals and the Role of the Family.*
- Prof. Ombretta Fumagalli Carulli
- Prof. Louis Sabourin
- H.E. Amb. Pierre Morel
- Dr. Antonio M. Battro



And now the Samaritan enters the stage. What will he do? He does not ask how far his obligations of solidarity extend. Nor does he ask about the merits required for eternal life. Something else happens: His heart is wrenched open. The Gospel uses the word that in Hebrew had originally referred to the mother's womb and maternal care. Seeing this man in such a state is a blow that strikes him "viscerally," touching his soul. "He had compassion"—that is how we translate the text today, diminishing its original vitality. Struck in his soul by the lightning flash of mercy, he himself now becomes the neighbor, heedless of any question or danger. The burden of the question thus shifts here. The issue is no longer which other person is a neighbor to me or not. The question is about me. I have to become the neighbor, and when I do, the other person counts for me "as myself."...One thing is clear: A new universality is entering the scene, and it rests on the fact that deep within I am already becoming a brother to all those I meet who are in need of my help.

The topical relevance of the parable is evident. When we transpose it into the dimensions of world society, we see how the peoples of Africa, lying robbed and plundered, matter to us. Then we see how deeply they are our neighbors; that our lifestyle, our history in which we are enmeshed, has plundered them and continues to do so. This is true above all in the sense that we have wounded their souls. Instead of giving them God, the God who has come close to us in Christ, which would have integrated and brought to completion all that is precious and great in their own traditions, we have brought to them the cynicism of a world without God in which all that counts is power and profit, a world that destroys moral standards so that corruption and the unscrupulous will to gain power are taken as a matter of course. And that applies not only to Africa.

Joseph Ratzinger Pope Benedict XVI, *Jesus of Nazareth. From the Baptism in the Jordan to the Transfiguration* (Doubleday, New York, 2007), pp. 197, 198-9.