

## INTERNATIONAL JUSTICE AND THE ROLE OF CHARITIES AND CIVIL SOCIETY, WITH SPECIAL REFERENCE TO THE ROLE OF THE CATHOLIC CHURCH

GIORGIO VITTADINI

1. International Justice and Ideology
2. Mechanicism in Development: Economicism, Demographic Control and Education
3. International Development and Social Justice: What Are the Alternatives?
4. Charities and International Justice: A Non-Mechanical Approach
5. The Condition for Everything: Training of the 'I' and Charity

### 1. INTERNATIONAL JUSTICE AND IDEOLOGY

The terms *development* and *international justice* have for decades expressed an ideal aspiration united with an enthusiasm, perhaps ingenious yet sincere, shared by Catholics and non-Catholics alike.

In *Populorum Progressio* Pope Paul VI recalled that 'development is the new name of peace'.<sup>1</sup> Since this statement by Paul VI, however, the path has not been straightforward. The debate over international justice is often conducted along ideological lines, starting from extreme and therefore predictably unilateral positions.

In the sixties, a humanistic culture – which had dominated up to that point and saw development as above all a human problem, one that essentially concerned a people's history and culture, including religion – suffered a defeat: first at the hands of the technological and economicist culture of UN organizations and Western governments and then of Leninist and Maoist currents, which attributed the roots of underdevelopment to colonialism and capitalist imperialism.

<sup>1</sup> Paulus P.P. VI, *Populorum Progressio*, Rome, 26 March 1967, n. 14.

Today, the debate over international justice and globalization remains highly relevant, though it has moved beyond the old ideological extremes and economicist terms that used to pervade it. Many observers share a positive judgment of the opportunities brought by globalization. The World Bank has estimated that if the process of globalization had never happened, the number of people in poverty would have increased by between 300 million and 650 million individuals over the previous ten years, rather than 150 million.<sup>2</sup>

All the same, it is pointless to hope that the market will miraculously solve all problems. Not all problems are being solved: there is the risk of increasing inequality, poverty, violence, material and spiritual degradation, and terrorism, even in countries with rapidly growing GDPs. Then there is the fact that entire regions of the globe – Africa, for example<sup>3</sup> – seem to remain largely on the margins of this development. The differences between countries, some of which have grown visibly, suggest that other areas have actually declined in absolute terms.<sup>4</sup>

Globalization has to be governed: this is the idea behind Stiglitz's latest book, *Making Globalization Work*.<sup>5</sup> Globalization based on the liberalization of markets works if it is accompanied by certain rules, by states intervening to correct distortions that inevitably arise, and by international organizations regulating relations between states.

What are the crucial factors of development that will lead to international justice? A short review of the facts will show how useless it is to think of development in mechanistic terms.

## 2. MECHANICISM IN DEVELOPMENT: ECONOMICISM, POPULATION CONTROL AND EDUCATION

There is an obvious starting point. We cannot suppose that international justice can be achieved simply by transfers of funds. In the early 1960s, the then president of Ghana, Kwame Nkrumah, started a project to build a

<sup>2</sup> Cf. World Bank, *Globalization growth and poverty. Building an inclusive world economy*, World Bank and Oxford University Press, Washington and Oxford (GB), 2002.

<sup>3</sup> Angus Maddison, in *The World Economy: A Millennial Perspective*, OECD Development Centre, Paris, 2001, notes that per capita GDP in Africa in real terms has not grown overall in the last 30 years.

<sup>4</sup> Cf. Angus Maddison, *The World Economy...*, cit.

<sup>5</sup> Joseph Stiglitz, *Making Globalization Work*, WW Norton, 2006.

large hydroelectric dam on the Volta River that was meant to produce enough electricity to be able to build an aluminum foundry. The new foundry was meant to process alumina from a refinery which in turn would process recently discovered bauxite deposits. A report by foreign consultants was enthusiastic. The lake created by damming the Volta would also establish a waterway linking Northern and Southern Ghana. The project would create 'a major new fishing industry on the lake'. Agriculture, with large-scale irrigation drawing water from the lake, would offset the flood loss of 3,500 square miles of land entailed by the project.

Some twenty years later a Ghanaian student at the University of Pittsburgh wrote a thesis comparing the performance of the Volta River project with the grandiose hopes of the president and his advisors. There was no aluminum foundry, no railroad, no bauxite mine. The construction of a fishery on the lake was 'wiped out by the mistakes of defective administration and the lack of any adequate mechanical equipment'. The people living on the lakeside, including 80,000 whose houses had been submerged, suffered from water-borne illnesses such as blindness and malaria.<sup>6</sup>

This example raises the question of the link between aid, investment, and development. The earliest development economists were vague about how long it would take for aid to increase investment and this, in turn, to increase growth, but they expected fairly rapid returns.

Since the 'quality' of the macro-political context had a decisive influence on the effectiveness of projects, it was felt essential in the 1980s to help countries build a suitable political and economic context. The World Bank began to make general loans to countries overburdened by debt. These loans required recipients to adopt certain rules of economic policy to ensure an environment favorable to growth. Good policies and the subsequent financing of development projects were meant to guarantee that countries would escape from the poverty trap into which many of them had fallen. This was called 'adjustment lending'.

Between 1980 and 1994 the World Bank and the IMF granted a series of adjustment loans to Ghana, Mauritius, Thailand and Korea. They produced annual per capita growth rates of between 1.4 and 6.7%.<sup>7</sup>

<sup>6</sup> William Easterly, *The Elusive Quest for Growth*, MIT Press, Cambridge Mass., 1999, pp. 26-28.

<sup>7</sup> Between 1980 and 1994, Ghana received 19 adjustment loans. After serious reforms in 1983, Ghana grew by 1.4% per capita from 1984 to 1994, a great improvement over the 1.6% contraction of GDP per capita between 1961 and 1983. The World Bank and the IMF

Yet the adjustment loans were not equally effective in other countries, for example, Argentina, Peru, and other Latin American countries. Why? We can find the answer by looking at how the different countries responded to the loans. The loans happened, but the adjustments often didn't. Indiscriminate loans created weak incentives to make the reforms necessary for growth.

A country with destructive policies and declining revenues receives 'concessional aid' more easily. A country with a fairly high standard of living, thanks to good macroeconomic government, has a right only to loans at market rates of interest (which are higher) and not to loans, like those described above, which are less expensive. By contrast, countries that improve leave the 'club' of countries that enjoy this privilege.<sup>8</sup> In short, it doesn't pay to be virtuous, and 'aid' is not always synonymous with 'investment' and 'development'.

Another way to grant aid, proposed also by John Paul II, is to cancel the debts of poor countries. But debt relief is not enough in countries that fail to change government policies. The same maladministration of funds that caused an increase in debt will prevent aid delivered through debt relief from reaching the people who really need it.<sup>9</sup>

In general, according to Easterly, the link between aid and investments has to pass two tests to be taken seriously. First, it has to be possible to recover a positive statistical correlation between aid and investment. Second, nearly all the aid has to be converted into investments: an extra 1% of GDP in aid should produce an extra 1% of GDP in investments.

By contrast, a study of the link between investment and aid covering 88 developing countries showed that by the first test only 17 out of 88 countries showed a positive statistical correlation between aid and investments. And only a small part of aid is converted into investments.<sup>10</sup> If we act in this mechanical way, the problem of incentive remains distorted.

gave Mauritius seven adjustment loans between 1980 and 1994. During this period Mauritius enjoyed remarkable per capita growth of 4.3% yearly. In the same period the World Bank and the IMF gave Thailand five adjustment loans (and the country's growth rate was 5.3%). Finally the World Bank and the IMF gave Korea seven adjustment loans, mainly concentrated in the early 1980s. In this period Korea attained annual per capita growth of 6.7%.

<sup>8</sup> William Easterly, *The Elusive...*, cit., p. 119.

<sup>9</sup> William Easterly, *The Elusive...*, cit., pp. 123-136.

<sup>10</sup> William Easterly, *The Ghost of Financing Gap: Testing the Growth Model Used in International Financial Institutions*, Journal of Development Economics, 1999, 80, 2. Walter W. Rostow predicted that investments would increase even more than proportionally

Apart from financial instruments, another suggested recipe for achieving international justice and development is population control. In the opinion of many development experts, population control was the elixir that would prevent poor countries from experiencing catastrophic forms of famine. Foreign aid to fund population control ('cash for condoms') became the panacea that would bring prosperity to poor countries. In 1968 Ehrlich published his bestseller, *The Population Bomb*,<sup>11</sup> about the problems caused by population growth. The annual rate of global population growth was then peaking, at about 2.1% a year. It was thought that runaway population growth, apart from increasing the number of mouths to be fed, would increase the number of the unemployed and produce more hands than could be absorbed by development, thus boosting unemployment to unimaginable levels. In short, the policy proposed was rigid family planning with the distribution of condoms as its main instrument.

Instead, the general and commonsense conclusion that emerges from studies into the effects of demographic growth on economic development is that there is no evidence indicating that limiting population growth will have any effect on the growth of per capita GDP.<sup>12</sup>

If aid and population control are not enough, will education and human capital suffice to achieve development and obtain international justice?

It is now widely known that investment in human capital, traditionally understood as enhancing people's occupational skills through education and professional training, leads to increased productivity. Some studies have emphasized that an increase in the average educational level of a year in OECD countries can generate, in the long term, a stable development of economic output by 3 to 6%.

It has often been repeated that the backwardness of large areas of Brazil and of other Latin American countries is caused by people being kept in ignorance even more than by social injustices (land ownership, low wages, and so on). On February 1, 1995, Brazil's leading daily, *A Folha de S. Paulo*, published a full page of comparative statistics for Brazil and South Korea, focusing on two years, 1960 and 1995. Brazilians were humbled to learn

because of increased saving by their beneficiaries. See Walter Whitman Rostow, *The Stages of Economic Growth. A Non-Communist Manifesto*, Cambridge University Press, Cambridge UK, 1960.

<sup>11</sup> Paul Erlich, *The Population Bomb*, Ballantine Books, New York, 1968.

<sup>12</sup> Ross Levine, David Renelt (1991), *Cross-Country Studies of Growth and Policy*, World Bank WP, p. 608.

that in 1960 illiteracy rates were 48% in Korea and 32% in Brazil, but by 1995 they were 9% and 18%.<sup>13</sup>

These data help to explain why South Korea has enjoyed strong economic growth, while Brazil bears the weight of some 30 to 35% of its inhabitants living below the poverty line. And yet Brazil has advanced social laws and efficient trade unions, while South Korea was destroyed by war (1950-1953) and then almost always ruled by military dictatorship.<sup>14</sup> What is true of Brazil is also true of Africa: in fact, it is even more evident here because the African peoples, through no fault of their own, have much lower rates of literacy and training.

Between 1960 and 1990, as a result of the paean to education in political circles, there was a considerable expansion of compulsory education. Stirred by the emphasis of the World Bank and other donors on the need for basic education, enrollment in elementary school reached 100% in half the countries of the world by 1990. Enrollment in lower middle schools increased from 80% in 1960 to 99% in 1990.<sup>15</sup>

There was a similar explosion in university enrollments. In 1960, 29 nations had no university students. In 1990, only three nations (Comoros, Gambia and Guinea-Bissau) had none at all. From 1960 to 1990 the average number of enrollment in universities in countries around the world increased more than sevenfold, from 1 to 7.5%.

How did economic growth respond to the educational explosion?

Certainly not as had been expected. The lack of correlation between growth in compulsory education and growth in GDP has been noted in various studies.<sup>16</sup> Above all, these scholars reject the theory that the impact of education has been homogeneous across all countries.<sup>17</sup> The main studies of

<sup>13</sup> In Korea 38% of Koreans attended University, in Brazil only 11%. Brazil spent 1.6% of its budget on education, Korea 3.7%, more than twice as much.

<sup>14</sup> See Piero Gheddo, *Educazione, vero motore dello sviluppo*, in *Atlantide*, cit. p. 10.

<sup>15</sup> Apart from this, there were true educational 'miracles', as in Nepal, which passed from 10% enrollment in primary schools in 1960 to 80% in 1990. In 1960 in Niger, only 1 student out of 200 was enrolled in a secondary school. Since 1960 the average number of enrollments in secondary schools worldwide has increased more than fourfold, from 13% in 1960 to 45% in 1990.

<sup>16</sup> On the failure of growth in Africa despite the educational explosion, see in particular, Lant Pritchett L. (2001), *Where Has All the Education Gone?*, World Bank Economic Review, 15 (3), pp. 367-391.

<sup>17</sup> The macro results derived from cross-country regressions show that the coefficients estimated have an average between countries which have highly different social, political,

education are unable to give adequate weighting to differences in the quality of education between different countries.<sup>18</sup> When this is done, however, there is a clear correlation between economic growth and quality of education.<sup>19</sup>

To understand why education is ineffective in many cases, we have to ask what people do with the skills they learn. In an economy with strong government intervention, it may happen that most of the effort goes to activities of a bureaucratic and subsidized kind. Yet these activities fail to create real development.

Furthermore, the quality of education will be different in an economy with incentives to invest in the future compared with an economy where such incentives are non-existent. Corruption, low salaries for teaching staff, and inadequate expenditure on textbooks and teaching materials aggravate the problems that destroy efforts to achieve quality in education.

In short, the performance of the educational expansion of the past four decades has been disappointing. Education by itself is not enough to ensure harmonious development, especially in poorer countries. In 1996, UNESCO's Education Committee published *Learning: The Treasure Within*. The president

and institutional characteristics and school systems that differ in terms of content, structure and quality (see Temple J. (1999), *The New Growth Evidence*, Journal of Economic Literature 37 (1), pp. 112-56; Sianesi B. and J. Van Reenen (2000), *The Return to Education: A Review of the Macro-Economic Literature*, Centre for the Economics of Education, London and Lee, Peseran and Smith (1997)).

In this respect, Harberger A. (1987) writes: 'What do Thailand, Dominican Republic, Zimbabwe, Greece and Bolivia have in common to be lumped together in the same regression analysis?' (in Temple, cit., p. 126). Various studies have shown the heterogeneous nature of the impact of education (Durlauf and Johnson, 1995), and this idea is also confirmed in the micro-economic literature, which shows that individual benefits of education vary considerably between different countries and even between the different regions of the same country.

Moreover, Krueger and Lindahl (see Krueger A.B. and M. Lindahl (2001), 'Education for Growth: Why and For Whom?', *Journal of Economic Literature*, 39 (December), pp. 1101-1136), show that by estimating different coefficients for different countries, the average coefficient of education is negative and in general not significant.

<sup>18</sup> See Barro J. and J.W. Lee (2000), 'International Data on Educational Attainment Updates and Implications', *NBER WP*, no. 7911.

<sup>19</sup> To obviate this limitation, use was made of international test results administered to students of different nationalities. As shown by recent cross-country regressions (see Barro R.J. (2000), 'Education and Economic Growth', WP Harvard University; Hanushek, E.A. and Kimko, D.D. (2000), *Schooling, Labor Force Quality, and the Growth of Nations*, American Economic Review, 90, pp. 1184-1208), these results – an indicator of the quality of education – correlate positively with the real per capita GDP growth rate.

of the commission, former president of the European Commission Jacques Delors, wrote in the introduction that the Commission did not see education as a 'miraculous cure'. Rather, it considered it as 'one of the main means available for achieving a more profound and harmonious form of human development, to reduce poverty, exclusion, ignorance, oppression and war'.<sup>20</sup>

Schooling is a good thing, but it has to provide a return in terms of quality for the sacrifice asked of poor families required to send their children to school. Education must also be seen as part of a broader educational process capable of giving the children involved some hope of progress and of an ability to make something of their lives, as I try to point out below.

### 3. INTERNATIONAL DEVELOPMENT AND SOCIAL JUSTICE: WHAT ARE THE ALTERNATIVES?

If a mechanical approach to development and international justice are not enough, we now need to examine the participatory approach.

Since poverty and development are multidimensional phenomena, they need to be treated as such. There is a close link between lack of education, income levels, lack of representation (voice), health, and so on. For incentives to be effective, there has to be simultaneous evidence of change in the different dimensions of life and in opportunities. The UN's *Millennium Development Goals* embody this vision and express the increasing concern for the formation of 'good institutions' and good social capital. They also stress the need to generate a climate of trust and safety, as well as efficient procedures to simplify problems and enable people to gain experience of a possible path to development.

What is called for, therefore, is an approach capable of coherently taking into account the different dimensions of the experience of development.

The at least partial failures described above have thus led to a new approach in granting aid, namely, an integrated and participatory approach where the condition of the person and the context of his relationships prove important. This is a step forward, but we need to ask ourselves what conditions are needed so that it will not prove ideological. In international cooperation today, everyone is saying that a participatory approach to development projects and programs increases the effectiveness of results by placing the beneficiaries at the center.

<sup>20</sup> Jacques Delors, *Learning: The Treasure Within*, UNESCO Pub., New York, 1966.



Even the World Bank supports the participatory approach. In various publications it has particularly supported the most radical community-driven approach, because this makes it possible 'to increase sustainability, improve efficiency and effectiveness, allow efforts to reduce poverty to be carried out on the appropriate scale, make development processes more inclusive, give greater power to the poor, build social capital, strengthen governance, and integrate markets with the activities of the public sector'.<sup>21</sup>

In fact, the participatory principle responds to correct ideas concerning the primary role of the subjects and the sustainability of projects, factors that will be dealt with below and that show, to quote Stiglitz, that 'development is possible'.<sup>22</sup>

Yet the participatory method is not exempt from problems, some of which loom large, and this makes it susceptible to numerous criticisms. Things may not turn out as planned: rich and powerful groups tend to be well connected and they may destroy instead of building a common 'social capital'. Furthermore, these connections are embedded in the existing power structures and may only lead to an increase in the social capital of the most aggressive and influential members of the group. The adoption of a participatory approach may undermine the democratic method of representation; it may foster entitlement-based behaviors.<sup>23</sup>

A certain degree of dominance by elites may be inevitable, especially in rural areas where the elites are often local leaders endowed with political and moral authority. These leaders are often the only ones capable of communicating efficiently with people outside the community. They know how to read project documents, keep accounts, write reports and make suggestions.<sup>24</sup> On

<sup>21</sup> Dongier *et al.*, 2001, Dongier Philippe, Van Domelen Julie, Ostrom Elinor, Ryan Andrea, Wakeman Wendy, Bebbington Antony, Alkire Sabina, Esmail Talib, Polski Margatet, *Community Driven Development*. In: World Bank, *Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper Sourcebook* Vol.1, Washington, DC.

<sup>22</sup> Joseph Stiglitz, *Development Thinking at the Millennium*, in *Proceedings from the Annual Bank Conference on Development Economics 2000*, Washington: World Bank, 2001, pp. 13-38. (Paper Presented to the Annual World Bank Conference on Development Economics, Paris, June 26, 2000).

<sup>23</sup> Conning and Kevane, 2002, Conning Jonathan, Kevane Michael, 2002; *Community Based Targeting Mechanisms for Social Safety Nets: A Critical Review*, World Development, p. 30 (3).

<sup>24</sup> Mansuri Ghazala, Vijayendra Rao, 2004; *Community-Based and-Driven Development: A Critical Review*, *The World Bank Research Observer*.

the other hand, the fact that the rules of the project are defined by elites may discourage participation.<sup>25</sup>

The application of participatory methods in complex projects often delays their schedules.<sup>26</sup> To avoid problems, those who are supposed to carry out the program simplify the activity to something that can be delivered and measured easily, to the detriment of the results. In short, participation may have high costs: it may shift the cost of improvements, maintenance or planning activities on to the poor themselves, it may conceal forms of forced labor carried out under the direction of local leaders,<sup>27</sup> or contribute to the ideology of an authoritarian state.

Bureaucracies do not change style when confronted by participatory approaches. They simply internalize the new procedures and increase the costs, while those who really carry out the project get the impression that the usefulness of these procedures is limited. Participatory events often become charged with a political meaning or are carried out collusively in the planning phases, with dubious added informative value.

#### 4. CHARITIES AND INTERNATIONAL JUSTICE: A NON-MECHANICAL APPROACH

The idea of participation is right. What is wrong is that when it is translated into practice, it is done as if the participatory mechanism itself will make the processes more effective. So what is the right way?

At this point we have reached the heart of this contribution, namely, the subject of participatory projects. Who should be the subject of a cooperative project? There is clearly a role for the organizations of the Church and civil society, that is, for charities. What are they doing for development and international justice? Are they a decisive factor in creating a fairer relation-

<sup>25</sup> Bardhan Pranab, 2000; *Irrigation and Cooperation: An Empirical Analysis of 48 Irrigation Communities in South India*. Economic Development and Cultural Change, p. 48 (4).

<sup>26</sup> Harriss John, 2001; *Depoliticizing Development: The World Bank and Social Capital*. New Delhi: Left Word Books; Mosse David, 2001; *People's Knowledge, Participation and Patronage: Operations and Representations in Rural Development*. In Bill Cooke and Uma Kothari, 2001; *Participation: The New Tyranny*. London: Zed Books.

<sup>27</sup> Bowen John, 1986; *On the Political Construction of Tradition: Gotong Royong in Indonesia*. *Journal of Asian Studies*, 45 (3); Ribot Jesse, 1999; *Decentralization, Participation and Accountability in Sahelian Forestry: Legal Instruments of Political-Administrative Control*. Africa, p. 69.

ship between peoples? Or are they only marginal? Two examples will help us find an answer:

The first example is Father Berton, a Xaverian missionary in Sierra Leone, who has returned thousands of child soldiers, involved in the bloody wars that have tragically affected that country, to normal life. Father Berton says, 'The village of Masanka, on the left bank of the Ribbi River, looks very primitive. I had visited the village with a group of laymen who had become experts on Africa. I questioned them about what needed to be done, and they answered, "It's an excellent opportunity for development on a human scale, but we have to respect people, to respect the human values in their lives, and not make them precariously dependent by giving them the illusion of rapid Westernized development that would destroy their moral fiber"''.<sup>28</sup>

It almost sounds contradictory: 'Let's help them along the path of development, but protect them from development'.

A second example concerns a highly innovative cooperation project, the reconstruction of the favelas of Ribeira Azul<sup>29</sup> in the city of Salvador de Bahia in Brazil by AVSI, an Italian NGO financed by the World Bank and the Italian government. At the beginning of the project, participation was laden with ideological aspects and political demands. The group of representatives of the local community had a critical attitude and demanded a reply to their needs from the local institutions. Often, in what I believe is a common experience, they even lacked a clear awareness of their own needs.

Beginning in the third year of the project, participation was carried out through a more direct dialog between AVSI, the state government, and about 80 associations and non-governmental institutions present in the favelas. All the players active in the project can claim to have learned a lot. Maria Lourdes do Nascimento, known as Lourdinha, director of a public association in the Ribeira Azul area, says, 'A lot of us first thought that participation was simply a political demand and that was all; now we have understood that participation is much more. It is not just a demand. It means forming part of a process; it means making a process. It is another big challenge. We can say that the kind of participation that existed before

<sup>28</sup> Giuseppe Berton, *La pace rimane un desiderio senza uno sviluppo totale*, in *Atlantide*, 2007/1, p. 93.

<sup>29</sup> From 2001 to 2006 this is an area that was the object of an integrated urban and socio-economic reclamation project in the city of Salvador, Bahia (Brazil), including the elimination of 'slums on stilts' (Alagados) affecting 150,000 inhabitants.

was participation in different forms. But the idea is that we really feel part of this process, as if it were our own child'.

People learn from their shared experience. This happens to the institutions involved, which learn to deal with problems like guaranteeing secure ownership of land, sustainability in continuing benefits, retrieval of project costs (without which any project will remain local, not systematic, benefiting a relatively small group of people because of limited resources), and dealing with conditions of elevated informality, where the rules have to be discussed, understood and adjusted by the local population.

This is true of the members of the community, who learn through dialog what is involved in changing their way of life, as well as the value of education, hygiene and being good neighbors.<sup>30</sup>

Participation only produces benefits if there is a dialogue capable of involving all players. But the basis of this dialogue is people's desire for freedom and their awareness that the motive behind the project is a concern for them and their well-being. This is the challenge: to bring out the positive sides of a participatory approach, without falling into ideological schemes. AVSI has adopted a slogan that sums up this and other current experiences: *Sharing needs in order to share the meaning of life*. The word 'sharing' best expresses the significance of its method. It involves the continuous presence of people – technicians and professionals, locals and outsiders – who by sharing the work of planning and creating a project have a significant opportunity to grow professionally and in human terms. This is the key response to the question posed.

Thus the principal methodological aspects of the most effective NGOs and charities can be summed up as follows:<sup>31</sup>

a) *Awareness of the working subject and of the sustainability of the project*. The starting point is a meeting of people, often by chance, which then embodies a common attempt or project to deal systematically with an immediate need. This factor is the keystone of the success of a development project, since a meeting identifies a real interlocutor, mobilizes people, and clarifies the reasons for commitment.

This approach increases awareness of the problems and resources in the area in the information collection and analysis phase; it enables bet-

<sup>30</sup> Giuseppe Folloni and Stefanie Messner, L'approccio partecipativo nasce dalla persona, in *Atlantide*, cit., p. 79.

<sup>31</sup> Arturo Alberti, Il ruolo della cooperazione, in *Atlantide*, cit. p. 111.

ter decisions to be made, facilitating the local community's knowledge of the key concepts of the project and identification with its objectives (in the analysis of the alternatives for intervention); it strengthens awareness of the costs to be borne. The community is aware of the issues concerning the benefits generated by the project. This fosters its sustainability through participation in discussions regarding the costs of the project, alternative methods of recovering costs, and methods of management and maintenance.

b) *Appreciation for local human resources*, for the cultural heritage, and for the more or less highly structured forms in which the local community wants to provide for its needs in any given context. NGO and charity workers observe daily that every human community, even the most degraded, has a heritage of values, traditions, knowledge, and attempted responses, which is essential to use as a starting point.

c) *Project flexibility*. NGOs and charities, unlike governments or large international organizations, are in close contact with the population and are able to rapidly identify the changes needed to adapt to changes in working conditions.

d) *Promotion of an enlarged partnership*, by seeking to create the conditions for the growth of local ownership that will guarantee the continuation of the work which began with the contribution of the international aid organizations. The sustainability of a project is closely dependent on an effective partnership with a real taking on of responsibility by the local actors in development. The project has to be understood as a process shared with others, through which they themselves identify the needs, forms of organization, objectives and means for carrying out a common idea, not only in its material forms (schools, hospitals, and the like), but also in its essence and function with respect to the path taken by the community or group of people for whose sake the project was devised.

e) *Accompanying the work after the conclusion of the formal project*. If we care about people's progress and growth, we will not consider the whole project to be finished with the drafting of the final report. We have to expect a period when the administrative responsibility of the NGO or charity has ceased, but the need remains to keep an eye on the development of the work in the first years of autonomy.

What has been said fits in with the findings of the most recent social theory. The issue of Catholic and other charities which work in international cooperation should be analyzed within the broader context of the works of the third (or non-profit) sector in modern society.

Numerous studies in recent years by scholars such as Salamon,<sup>32</sup> Anheier,<sup>33</sup> Hirst<sup>34</sup> and Wagner<sup>35</sup> have shown that a modern society and economy cannot and should not consist simply of a state sector and a private sector, each with its own agencies, while the 'third sector' remains marginal. This is particularly true of international cooperation.

Non-profit bodies are essentially different from both state and private organizations, not only in the way they redistribute their revenues but also in the philosophy, governance, objectives and methods of their members, as well as by their commitment to a socially useful entrepreneurial activity. State organizations tend to maximize equality of treatment; private organizations maximize efficiency and quality; non-profit enterprises and charities, with their ideal purposes, can contribute and surpass the other two in both respects, while also being capable of supporting disadvantaged social groups that governments fail to reach, and maximizing collective well-being in certain markets that cannot be reached by private bodies.

As an example of the sort of policy that could guide the work of NGOs and charities, we can say that

- cooperation in development has to be the fruit of a policy for the development of poor countries, adopted responsibly by Parliament, and not a mere budget entry that can be plundered at the first financial difficulty;
- cooperation in development is an integral part of foreign policy, and in many areas of the world cooperation projects are the main way the state is present and active;
- it is essential to progressively reduce the levels of tied aid (the percentage of aid tied to contracts with businesses), which in 2004 was, in the case of Italy, still about 90%, while the recommendations of the DAC (Development Assistance Committee) of the OECD is that this practice should be abolished;

<sup>32</sup> Salamon L.M., Anheier H.K. (1998), *The Nonprofit Sector in the Developing World: A Comparative Analysis*, Johns Hopkins Non-Profit Sector Series, Manchester University Press, Manchester.

<sup>33</sup> Anheier H.K. (2000), *The Third Sector in Europe: Four Theses*, Crisp, *I servizi di pubblica utilità alla persona*, Franco Angeli, Milan, pp. 33-38.

<sup>34</sup> Hirst P., Bader V. (2001) (ed.), *Associative Democracy: The Real Third Way*, Prank Cass, London, p. 2.

<sup>35</sup> Wagner A. (2000), *The Role of Civil Action in a Global Society: Towards a Politics of Sustainable Globalization*, Crisp, *I servizi di pubblica utilità alla persona*, Franco Angeli, Rome, pp. 17-25.

– it is essential to increase financial resources. For the first time since 1997, the quantity of foreign aid assigned to poor countries by the 22 countries of the OECD's Development Assistance Committee has shrunk instead of rising. The 103.9 billion dollars donated by industrialized countries in 2006 (including the 19.2 billion dollars' worth of canceled debt) is 5.1% less than was donated in 2005 in real terms.

##### 5. THE CONDITION FOR EVERYTHING: EDUCATION OF THE 'I' AND CHARITY

We have now reached the crux of the problem. Who is the subject of these charities? What leads men to commit themselves to this work? There is a prevalent idea that free individual choices and the common good cannot be realized simultaneously. But not everyone thinks like this. Nobel Prize winner for economics, Kenneth J. Arrow, asserts that 'it is the ordering according to values which takes into account all the desires of the individual, including the highly important socializing desires'.<sup>36</sup> In discussing the majority principle, he refers to the free association and unification of special institutions and the reconciliation of differing desires by the force of shared ideals. Concord is not achieved on the plane of social, economic or political conflict. It is an ideal concord which follows the principle of the majority in politics and the best use of the competent and deserving in business, in a dynamic of healthy competition.

Likewise, in a different context and following different methods, Father Luigi Giussani spoke of the decisive importance of desire in the way we relate to reality. He says, 'Desire is like the spark that fires the engine. All human actions are born from this phenomenon, from this constituent dynamism in man. Desire ignites man's engine. Starting here, he sets out and seeks bread and water, he seeks work, seeks a woman; he begins to look around for a more comfortable armchair and a more convenient lodging; he takes an interest in why some have and others have not; he is interested in why certain people are treated in a certain way and he is not, precisely by virtue of the enlargement, the expansion, the maturation of those stimuli that he has inside him, which the Bible calls the heart'.<sup>37</sup>

<sup>36</sup> Kenneth J. Arrow, *Social Choice and Individual Values*, John Wiley, New York, 1963, p. 10.

<sup>37</sup> Luigi Giussani, *L'io, il potere, le opere*, Marietti, Genova 2000, p. 173.

The heart of man, in all periods and places and among all peoples, lies in the religious sense, the desire for goodness, a complex of needs and fundamental evidences of truth, justice and beauty. Among these evidences and needs, that of charity is fundamental.<sup>38</sup> For this reason, as Benedict XVI says in his encyclical *Deus Caritas Est*, 'Love – *caritas* – will always prove necessary, even in the most just society. There is no ordering of the state so just that it can eliminate the need for a service of love. Whoever wants to eliminate love is preparing to eliminate man as such'.<sup>39</sup>

Likewise, in *Il senso della caritativa*, Father Giussani says that charity in man is above all a need, the need that nature endows us with that leads us to interest ourselves in others, and 'the more deeply we experience this need and this duty, the more we fulfill ourselves'.<sup>40</sup> In the same way, Julián Carrón, President of the Fraternity of Communion and Liberation, comments, 'This is why it is extremely important to understand the origins of our gesture of charity, because all our voluntarism is not enough to content ourselves and others. Everything is very small, tiny, compared with the capacity of the spirit, even when we are able to solve all problems and difficulties'.<sup>41</sup>

However, the dominant mentality tends to reduce man's desires systematically, seeking to govern and flatten them, to the point of creating confusion in the young and cynicism in adults.

We reduce the need of the other to what we imagine or to what we have decided. In this lies the principal role of charities and of the Catholic Church: the education of the person through the encounter with Christ present in history, so that man may live his religious sense to the utmost, truly desiring to live through charity and pursue the true good of others.

Father Giussani says, 'I do not know what they really need, I cannot measure it, I don't have it. It is a measure that I do not possess: it is a measure that is in God. This is why "laws" and "justice" can crush, if we forget or claim to replace the only concrete thing there is: the person, and love for the person'.<sup>42</sup>

The Church continues to educate toward this human position.

<sup>38</sup> Luigi Giussani, *The Religious Sense*, Montreal 1997, pp. 100ff.

<sup>39</sup> Benedictus P.P. XVI, encyclical letter *Deus Caritas Est*, 25 December 2005, 28b.

<sup>40</sup> Luigi Giussani, *Il senso della caritativa*, Società Cooperativa editoriale Nuovo Mondo, 2005, p. 6.

<sup>41</sup> Julián Carrón, La carità sarà sempre necessaria, anche nella società più giusta, Notes of the office-holders of the Tende AVSI 2006/7 and the AVSI Point. Milan, 18 November 2006. In *Tracce*, December 2006.

<sup>42</sup> Luigi Giussani, *Il senso della caritativa*, cit., p. 9.



This is why the most original voice in support of development in the world is that of the papal Magisterium and the efforts of the movements inspired by it.

It was the papal Magisterium that first warned against the possible reductions we have described so far. Two encyclicals help us identify the most suitable perspective for viewing the problem. In *Populorum Progressio* we read, 'The development We speak of here cannot be restricted to economic growth alone. To be authentic, it must be well rounded; it must foster the development of each man and of the whole man'.<sup>43</sup> And *Redemptoris Missio* states, 'But a people's development does not derive primarily from money, material assistance or technological means, but from the formation of consciences and the gradual maturing of ways of thinking and patterns of behavior'.<sup>44</sup>

Speaking about and seeking to embody a reference to the desire for happiness and freedom shared by all; refusing to ignore the fact that limitations and sins exist in all of us, not only in our enemies; perceiving the uniqueness of every person loved individually by God; living the experience of a new humanity stemming from the encounter with Jesus Christ present in history: these have always meant fostering attempts to meet needs in ways that respect man and charities that work for true justice in a context of globalization in the service of the concrete man, tending toward good one step at a time, without utopian evasions. This is why the papal Magisterium and the Church stake so much on the education of the person and on subsidiarity.

How can we combine the action of NGOs with the action of governments and institutions? Benedict XVI's encyclical *Deus Caritas Est* states, 'We do not need a state which regulates and controls everything, but a state which, in accordance with the principle of subsidiarity, generously acknowledges and supports initiatives arising from the different social forces and combines spontaneity with closeness to those in need'.<sup>45</sup> For this reason Father Gheddo, director of the historical office of PIME, recently pointed out, 'Aid should be given (it has to be given!) not "from state to state", but "from people to people". If aid is "people to people", then the results are different'.<sup>46</sup>

<sup>43</sup> Paulus P.P. VI, *Populorum Progressio*, cit., p. 14.

<sup>44</sup> Ioannes Paulus P.P. II, *Redemptoris Missio*, Rome, 7 December 1980, p. 58.

<sup>45</sup> Benedictus P.P. XVI, encyclical letter *Deus Caritas Est*, cit.

<sup>46</sup> Piero Gheddo, *Educazione, vero motore dello sviluppo*, cit., p. 10.

Thus, generating works bound up with the desire for good, with the religious sense, and with charity also enables us not to close our eyes to every act of barbarity, to discern between one state and another in terms of their respect for the dignity of the 'I', and to stress the importance of international agencies as the venues for negotiating peaceful development.

In the world, this way of working and these new facts of life, which grow out of the Christian life, are encountering similar attempts promoted by those who sincerely embody their human desire, their religions, and their ideals in their lives. This is the beginning of a new grass-roots movement for justice.